

#### CALIFORNIA STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

BETTY T. YEE First District San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District Ontario/ Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JUDY CHU Fourth District Los Angeles

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

Ramon J. Hirsig Executive Director

# Capitalization Rate Study

Property and Special Taxes Department David J. Gau, Deputy Director

State-Assessed Properties Division Stanley Y. Siu, Chief

March 2007

"The income approach to value includes any method of converting an income stream into a present value estimate (i.e., an indicator of current fair market value). The income approach is also called the capitalization approach because capitalization is the process of converting an expected income into an indicator of value.

The methods or techniques used in the income approach may be relatively simple (e.g., income or rent multipliers and direct capitalization), or more complex (e.g., various yield capitalization techniques). All of these methods are referred to as capitalization techniques because they convert an expected future income stream into a present value estimate.

The income approach requires careful application because small variations in its key variables (capitalization rate, duration of income stream, estimated income and expenses, etc.) will be mathematically leveraged into a wide range of estimated value. This is particularly true for the capitalization rate variable. The accuracy of the income approach is no greater than the validity of the assumptions used to estimate the key variables. The mathematical techniques used in the approach, while sometimes complicated, are merely tools for converting these assumptions into an estimate of current market value."

#### I. Authority for Capitalization Rate Study

Property Tax Rule 8 (g) (2) provides the authority for the method in which the capitalization rates were developed in this study. The rule states "the capitalization rate may be developed...

By deriving a weighted average of the capitalization rates for debt and for equity capital appropriate to the California money markets (the band-of-investment method) and adding increments for expenses that are excluded from outgo because they are based on the value that is being sought or the income that is being capitalized. The appraiser shall weight the rates for debt and equity capital by the respective amounts of such capital he deems most likely to be employed by prospective purchasers."

### II. Band of Investment Approach

In its simplest form, the band of investment method assumes that a purchaser would pay cash (or equity) for a portion of the property and would borrow the balance of the purchase price. For example:

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Assessors' Handbook 501, Basic Appraisal, Revised January 2002

This booklet contains a study for each of the eight major state assessee industry groups<sup>2</sup> in California. Industry data was compiled by groups with similar Value Line financial ratings.

Generally accepted appraisal procedures were used to estimate the cost of capital for debt and equity. The long term debt cost is the cost for a particular risk class of debt on the lien date. The equity rate reflects the rate of return or compensation that will satisfy the risk that a prospective purchaser would assume by investing in the property.

The rates derived in this study are basic capitalization rates and represent the after-tax return on investment only. Any increments required to be added by Property Tax Rule 8(g)(2), such as income or ad valorem tax components, are in addition to the rates listed.

#### A. Capital Structure - Prospective Purchaser vs. Company Specific

State assessees often ask why the Board does not use the current capital structure of individual companies in the band-of-investment method. As explained in Rule 8 (g)(2), the appraiser shall weight the rates of debt and equity capital by the respective amounts of such capital deemed most likely to be employed by a prospective purchaser.

Therefore, the capital structure contemplated is a representative or typical structure of an industry group of companies with a similar bond rating, not that of the present owner. The objective of doing so is to strike an optimum capital structure from the perspective of a potential investor.

#### B. Company Specific Debt Rates

In many cases the debt component of the capital structure for a prospective purchaser and the individual company being assessed may be similar. In cases where, in the judgement of staff, the debt ratings of the individual companies being assessed and the debt ratings of prospective purchasers are similar, the company-specific bond rating has been used to develop the appropriate debt component of the recommended capitalization rate.

# C. Impact of Holding Companies on Determination of Capital Structure

Many of the larger state assessees are subsidiaries of their holding company. Stock purchases related to a subsidiary must be made through the parent holding company. Since there is no direct market data for state assesses that are subsidiaries of a holding company, staff must rely, in great part, upon market data related to the holding company.

ii

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Gas, Electric & Water; Natural Gas Transmission; Local Exchange; Electric Generation; Interexchange; Wireless; Pipeline; Railroad

#### III. Capital Asset Pricing Model

The Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) is a widely accepted theory used to estimate the cost of equity capital. In the application the CAPM, the most sensitive component affecting the outcome is the estimate of the beta<sup>3</sup> statistic. The choice of different time frames and frequencies of measurement in the calculation of the beta can produce significantly different results. Another factor in the use of beta is the choice of whether to use an unadjusted beta or a beta adjusted to reflect the fact that betas tend to revert to the mean over time. In this study, betas were obtained from three separate sources: one adjusted (Value Line) and two unadjusted. Generally the betas from the three sources are averaged to establish the beta used to estimate the cost of equity capital for a specific industry. In general, the average beta for highly regulated industries such as gas or electric transmission and distribution understates the risk inherent in those securities. For companies in highly regulated environments, the Value Line adjusted beta was chosen as a better estimate of the relative risk in the calculation of the required equity return.

#### IV. Flotation Costs

When new issues of both debt and equity capital are sold to investors, the issuing company incurs transaction costs such as underwriting fees, legal expenses, and prospectus preparation costs. These costs of issuing securities are known as flotation costs. Flotation costs effectively reduce the net proceeds that a firm will receive from issuing securities. This is much like loan fees or points on a mortgage. The cost of capital is adjusted upward to reflect the flotation costs incurred to issue the securities. Since the flotation costs are reflected in the weighted average cost of capital, the flotation costs should not be allowed as expenses in projecting cash flows to be capitalized. Each basic capitalization rate in this study has been adjusted to reflect flotation costs.

#### V. Size Adjustment

Investors typically consider small capitalization stocks as riskier investments than large capitalization stocks. It follows that investors require additional return to take on the risk of an investment in a small capitalization stock. According to Ibbotson & Associates<sup>4</sup>, the additional risk is not reflected in the calculation of beta. Where the Capital Asset Pricing Model was relied upon in assigning the cost of capital to companies whose size is ranked in the lower deciles of the New York Stock Exchange, the size premium adjustment as reported by Ibbotson Associates in the 2005 Valuation Edition Yearbook was considered.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The covariance of the returns of a security regressed against the returns of the overall market - a measurement of relative volatility

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> SBBI: 2005 Valuation Edition Yearbook

#### VI. Utilization of Other Studies and Data

Staff appraisers considered data and capitalization rate studies submitted by assessees and interested parties and, where appropriate utilized them in the development of the staff derived rates.

The capitalization rates published in this study are intended to be applied to the unitary operations of the companies subject to assessment by the California State Board of Equalization.

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas, Electric and Water Companies

			Ratings		Cap	pital Structu	re	Ra	tes of Retu	m	Basic
			Preferred		Common	Preferred		Common	Preferred		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Stock	Bond	Equity	Stock	Debt	Equity	Stock	Debt	Rate
Gas and El	ectric Companies										
141	San Diego Gas & Electric	A	baa1	A1	53%	2%	45%	11.31%	6.45%	5.99%	8.82%
135	Pacific Gas & Electric	B++	baa3	Baa1	52%	1%	47%	11.99%	6.53%	6.21%	9.22%
148	Southern California Edison	В	b3	A3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.75%	6.13%	9.32%
184	Avista Corporation	В	ba3	Baa3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.64%	6.40%	9.44%
106	PacifiCorp	Not Rated	baa3	A3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.53%	6.13%	9.32%
146	Sierra Pacific Power	C+	b2	Ba1	52%	1%	47%	12.99%	6.71%	6.50%	9.88%
191	Arizona Public Service Company	Not Rated		Baa1	51%		49%	13.26%		6.21%	9.80%
103	Anza Electric Cooperative	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
156	Atlantic Path 15, LLC	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
160	Valley Electric Association	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
173	<b>Surprise Valley Electrification</b>	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
176	Plumas-Sierra Rural Electric	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
185	<b>Mountain Utilities</b>	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
193	Southwest Transmission Coop., Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
Natural Ga	s Distribution and Storage Companies										
149	Southern California Gas	A	baa1	A1	53%	2%	45%	11.64%	6.45%	5.99%	8.99%
152	<b>Southwest Gas</b>	В	baa3	Baa3	52%	1%	47%	11.88%	6.53%	6.40%	9.25%
192	Alpine Natural Gas	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
194	West Coast Gas Company, Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
195	Wild Goose, Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
198	Lodi Gas Storage, LLC	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
Water Con	npanies										
101	Southern California Water	B+		A2	55%		45%	10.47%		6.05%	8.48%

## California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies

		Ratings Capital Structure		Rates	Basic			
				Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
153	Transwestern Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
180	North Baja Pipeline, LLC	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
187	Mojave Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
188	Kern River Gas Transmission Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
189	<b>Standard Pacific Gas Line Incorporated</b>	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
190	Tuscarora Gas Transmission Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
196	Questar Southern Trails Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
197	El Paso Natural Gas Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%

### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies

		Ratir	ngs	Capital Stru	cture	Rates of I	Return	Basic
				Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
279	Pacific Bell Telephone Company	A+	A2	80%	20%	12.30%	6.05%	11.05%
201	Verizon California, Inc.	A+	A3	80%	20%	12.30%	6.13%	11.07%
294	SureWest Telephone	В	Not Rated	70%	30%	13.35%	6.29%	11.23%
284	Citizens Telecommunications Co. of California, Inc.	В	Not Rated	70%	30%	13.35%	6.29%	11.23%
	Other Local Exchange Companies	Not Rated	Not Rated	70%	30%	14.66%	6.94%	12.35%

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities

	Rat	ings	Capital Structure Rates of Return				Basic
			Common		Common		Cap
Facility Type	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate <sup>4</sup>
Recently Constructed Facilities <sup>1</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	15.71%	6.83%	12.16%
Composite Facilities <sup>2</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	17.02%	7.34%	13.14%
		1,0011000	0070	10,0	17.0270	7.6.770	1011170
Older Facilities <sup>3</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	17.80%	7.85%	13.82%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Recently Constructed Facilities - Facilities constructed after September 1996 incorporating modern electric generation technologies at the time they were built.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Composite Facilities - Facilities that were sold off by vertically integrated electric utilities and for which replacements of some obsolete generation units with modern electric generation technologies have been made.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Older Facilities - Facilities that were sold off by vertically integrated electric utilities and for which no replacements, other than for routine maintenance, have been made.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Staff may adjust the rates stated above if the specific situation of a facility warrants an adjustment to its basic capitalization rate.

### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies

		Rati	ngs	Capital	Structure	Rates	of Return	Basic
				Common	Long Term	Common	Long Term	Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
2310	AT&T Communications, Inc.	A+	A2	75%	25%	14.14%	6.05%	12.12%
2510	A1C1 Communications, Inc.	Ai	A2	7570	2370	17.17/0	0.0370	12.12 /0
2014	Sprint Communications Co., L.P.	B+	Baa3	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
2274	MCIWorldCom Network Services, Inc.	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
2372	MCI Metro Access Transmission Services, LLC	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
7630	<b>Broadwing Communications, LLC</b>	В	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
7522	Time Warner Telecom of California, L.P.	В	Baa2	75%	25%	14.66%	6.29%	12.57%
7761	Level 3 Communications, LLC	C++	Caa2	60%	40%	16.75%	7.26%	12.96%
2043	Pac-West Telecomm, Inc.	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.37%	13.00%
2463	<b>Qwest Communications Corporation</b>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.37%	13.00%
7686	Primus Telecommunications, Inc.	C	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.48%	13.04%
	Other Interexchange Carriers	Not Rated	Not Rated	60%	40%	19.90%	8.13%	15.19%
	Other Interexchange Resellers	Not Rated	Not Rated	60%	40%	23.04%	8.90%	17.38%

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies

			Capital	Structure	Rates of R	leturn	Basic
			Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Rating	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
2512	Verizon Wireless (VAW) LLC	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2513	Sacramento Valley Limited Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2532	Los Angeles SMSA Ltd., Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2559	GTE Mobilnet of California, Ltd. Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2606	Cingular Wireless, LLC	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2720	Sprint PCS	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2737	<b>Sprint Nextel Corporation</b>	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2748	<b>OmniPoint Communications Inc.</b>	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2552	Fresno MSA Limited Partnership	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2627	GTE Mobilnet of Santa Barbara L.P.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2671	California Rural Service Area #1, Inc.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2733	Metro PCS California/Florida, Inc.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2745	West Coast P.C.S.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
	Other Wireless Companies	NR-3	70%	30%	17.02%	7.12%	14.05%
	Wireless Reseller Companies	NR-4	65%	35%	19.63%	7.63%	15.43%

NR-1: Companies providing wireless service to the largest California service areas

NR-2: Companies providing wireless service to midsize California service areas

NR-3: Other wireless carriers (including Radio Telephone companies)

NR-4: All wireless reseller companies

## California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies

		Rating	gs	Capital S	tructure	Rates	of Return	Basic
				Common				Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
402	CALNEV Pipe Line LLC	NR-1	NR-b	70%	30%	12.57%	6.45%	10.73%
461	SFPP, L.P.	NR-1	NR-b	70%	30%	12.57%	6.45%	10.73%
479	Chevron Pipeline Company	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
468	Shell California Pipeline Company L.P.	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
486	Pacific Pipeline System, LLC	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
480	ConocoPhillips Pipe Line Company	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
	Other Pipeline Companies	NR-3	NR-c	70%	30%	14.14%	7.47%	12.14%

## California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies

-		Rating	gs	Capital St	ructure	Rates o	f Return	·
SBE	Company			Common		Common		Basic Cap
No.	Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
843	Union Pacific Railroad Company	A	Baa2	75%	25%	13.87%	6.45%	12.02%
804	<b>BNSF Railway Company</b>	B++	Baa2	75%	25%	13.87%	6.45%	12.02%
802	Central Oregon & Pacific Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
810	California Northern Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
813	Pacific Harbor Lines	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
850	<b>Modesto &amp; Empire Traction Company</b>	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
865	San Diego & Imperial Valley Railroad Co. Inc.	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
882	Trona Railway Co.	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
897	San Joaquin Valley Railroad Company	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
899	Arizona & California Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
	Other Railroad Companies	NR-2	NR-2	60%	40%	16.23%	9.00%	13.34%

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas, Electric and Water Companies

			Ratings		Cap	pital Structu	re	Ra	tes of Retu	m	Basic
			Preferred		Common	Preferred		Common	Preferred		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Stock	Bond	Equity	Stock	Debt	Equity	Stock	Debt	Rate
Gas and El	ectric Companies										
141	San Diego Gas & Electric	A	baa1	A1	53%	2%	45%	11.31%	6.45%	5.99%	8.82%
135	Pacific Gas & Electric	B++	baa3	Baa1	52%	1%	47%	11.99%	6.53%	6.21%	9.22%
148	Southern California Edison	В	b3	A3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.75%	6.13%	9.32%
184	Avista Corporation	В	ba3	Baa3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.64%	6.40%	9.44%
106	PacifiCorp	Not Rated	baa3	A3	52%	1%	47%	12.25%	6.53%	6.13%	9.32%
146	Sierra Pacific Power	C+	b2	Ba1	52%	1%	47%	12.99%	6.71%	6.50%	9.88%
191	Arizona Public Service Company	Not Rated		Baa1	51%		49%	13.26%		6.21%	9.80%
103	Anza Electric Cooperative	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
156	Atlantic Path 15, LLC	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
160	Valley Electric Association	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
173	<b>Surprise Valley Electrification</b>	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
176	Plumas-Sierra Rural Electric	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
185	<b>Mountain Utilities</b>	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
193	Southwest Transmission Coop., Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	13.26%		7.15%	10.27%
Natural Ga	s Distribution and Storage Companies										
149	Southern California Gas	A	baa1	A1	53%	2%	45%	11.64%	6.45%	5.99%	8.99%
152	<b>Southwest Gas</b>	В	baa3	Baa3	52%	1%	47%	11.88%	6.53%	6.40%	9.25%
192	Alpine Natural Gas	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
194	West Coast Gas Company, Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
195	Wild Goose, Inc.	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
198	Lodi Gas Storage, LLC	Not Rated		Not Rated	51%		49%	12.73%		7.15%	10.00%
Water Con	npanies										
101	Southern California Water	B+		A2	55%		45%	10.47%		6.05%	8.48%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas, Electric and Water Companies Industry Notes

- The focus of the 2007 capitalization rate study is to develop capitalization rates that reflect regulated gas and electric operations.
- Staff considered the equity rates derived from the sample as well as recent California Public Utilities Commission decisions that established rates of return. Capital structures used are based on staff judgment with consideration given to the CPUC authorized capital structures for the companies in the industry. A potential purchaser would likely use the capital structure that the regulatory agency would deem optimum to the ratepayers and the utility. Thus, the capital structure represented by the sample companies is given less consideration. The staff also reviewed capitalization rate studies submitted by PG&E and SCE.
- Staff relied upon the results of the following models in the development of equity rates:
  - 1. Discounted Cash Flow
  - 2. Capital Asset Pricing Model-Consideration was giving to both the ex post and ex ante risk premiums
  - 3. CPUC decisions that established rates of returns
- CMS Energy was not included in the 2007 sample due to its stressed financial condition.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equity	y			Preferred	Stock			Debt			
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	•	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	
A	10.80%	4.50%	11.31%					Aa3	5.82%	1.70%	5.92%	
B++	11.45%	4.50%	11.99%	baa1	6.34%	1.70%	6.45%	A1	5.88%	1.70%	5.99%	
В	11.70%	4.50%	12.25%	baa2	6.38%	1.70%	6.49%	A2	5.95%	1.70%	6.05%	
C++	12.41%	4.50%	12.99%	baa3	6.42%	1.70%	6.53%	A3	6.03%	1.70%	6.13%	
C	12.41%	4.50%	12.99%	ba1	6.45%	1.70%	6.56%	Baa1	6.10%	1.70%	6.21%	
NR	12.66%	4.50%	13.26%	ba2	6.49%	1.70%	6.60%	Baa2	6.18%	1.70%	6.29%	
				ba3	6.53%	1.70%	6.64%	Baa3	6.29%	1.70%	6.40%	
				b2	6.60%	1.70%	6.71%	Ba1	6.39%	1.70%	6.50%	
				b3	6.64%	1.70%	6.75%	Ba2	6.50%	1.70%	6.61%	
				caa1	6.67%	1.70%	6.79%	Ba3	6.61%	1.70%	6.72%	
				caa3	6.71%	1.70%	6.83%	B1	6.71%	1.70%	6.83%	
								В3	6.93%	1.70%	7.05%	
								NR	7.03%	1.70%	7.15%	

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs  $= K_u$ 

Where:  $K_u$ = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Summary of Rates of Return

Common 1	Equity	P	erferred Stock			Bonds	
Value Line	Rate of	Moody's P/S	Moody	Rate of	Moody's Bond	Moody	Rate of
Rating	Return 1	Yields	Rating	Return <sup>2</sup>	Yields	Rating	Return <sup>2</sup>
A	10.80%		aa1	6.22%	Aaa=N/A	Aaa2	5.54%
B++	11.45%	aa=N/A	aa2	6.23%		Aaa3	5.61%
В	11.70%		aa3	6.23%		Aa1	5.68%
C++	12.41%		a1	6.25%	Aa=5.75%	Aa2	5.75%
C	12.41%	a=6.27%	a2	6.27%		Aa3	5.82%
NR <sup>3</sup>	12.66%		a3	6.31%		A1	5.88%
			baa1	6.34%	A=5.95%	A2	5.95%
		baa=6.38%	baa2	6.38%		A3	6.03%
			baa3	6.42%		Baa1	6.10%
			ba1	6.45%	Baa=6.18%	Baa2	6.18%
			ba2	6.49%		Baa3	6.29%
			ba3	6.53%		Ba1	6.39%
			b1	6.56%		Ba2	6.50%
			b2	6.60%		Ba3	6.61%
			b3	6.64%		B1	6.71%
			caa1	6.67%		B2	6.82%
			caa3	6.71%		В3	6.93%
						NR	7.03%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Rate of Return on Common Equity was developed by staff based on the relative risk of the utilities in conjunction with the results of the various financial models and pertinent information from various sources. Consideration was given to the recent California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) decisions that established rates of return. The 2007 return on equity (ROE) for PG&E is 11.35% which results in a corresponding 8.79% return on rate base (ROR). ROE for SCE is 11.60% which results in a corresponding 8.77% ROR, and ROE for SDG&E is 10.70% which results in a corresponding 8.23% ROR. These rates have not been changed since last year. Southern California Gas has a benchmark ROR of 8.68% which remains in effect until further revised by the CPUC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Rates of Return on Preferred Stocks and Bonds were based on Moody's "Utility Preferred Stock Yields" and "Utility Bond Yields", December 2006 report. However, because Moody assigns a yield to the groups Aaa, Aa, A and Baa for bonds; and aa, a, and baa for preferred stocks, the staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a further refinement of the ratings.

For companies whose common equity are not rated (NR), staff judgment is used in assigning the rates of return because the circumstances or reasons for not rating the common equity are different for each company.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

		Value Line Ratings	
Component	A++, A+	B++, B+, B	C++, C+,C
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%	13.71%	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%	8.88%	8.88%
Beta <sup>3</sup>	1.05	1.10	1.26
Adjusted Risk Premium	9.36%	9.73%	11.16%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity <sup>4</sup>	14.19%	14.56%	15.99%

Dividend Yield for S&P 500 December 29, 2006
 5 Year projected growth per Merrill Lynch Expected future return, S&P 500

<sup>1.81%</sup> 11.90% 13.71%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The estimated betas are based on the gas and electric beta analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Due to rate regulation by the CPUC, staff has relied on recent equity rates authorized by the CPUC for Pacific Gas and Electric Co., Southern California Edison Co. and San Diego Gas and Electric Co.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies

# **Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post**

		Value Line Ratings	
Component	A++, A+	B++, B+, B	C++, C+
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%	12.30%	12.30%
Less: Income-Long Term Government Bonds (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	5.20%	5.20%	5.20%
Risk Premium	7.10%	7.10%	7.10%
Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.05	1.10	1.26
Adjusted Risk Premium	7.48%	7.78%	8.92%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity <sup>4</sup>	12.31%	12.61%	13.75%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas are based on the gas and electric beta analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Due to rate regulation by the CPUC, staff has relied on recent equity rates authorized by the CPUC for Pacific Gas and Electric Co., Southern California Edison Co. and San Diego Gas and Electric Co.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
A++	Consolidated Edison	48.07	2.90	2.80	2.30	2.32	4.83%	1.00%	2.82%	6.03%	5.83%	7.65%
A+	Ameren	53.73	3.05	2.80	2.54	2.54	4.73%	Nil	4.23%	5.68%	N/A	8.96%
A+	Exelon Corp	61.89	5.00	3.35	1.60	1.80	2.91%	11.00%	10.96%	8.08%	13.91%	13.87%
A+	FPL Group Inc	54.42	3.40	2.90	1.50	1.58	2.90%	5.50%	7.90%	6.25%	8.40%	10.81%
A	Allete	46.54	3.15	2.70	1.45	1.64	3.52%	9.00%	8.00%	6.77%	N/A	11.52%
A	CH Energy Group	52.80	2.85	2.70	2.16	2.16	4.09%	0.50%	3.00%	5.40%	4.59%	7.09%
A	Great Plains Energy	31.80	2.05	1.50	1.66	1.66	5.22%	Nil	1.61%	6.45%	N/A	6.83%
A	Hawaiian Electric	27.15	1.55	1.50	1.24	1.24	4.57%	Nil	3.86%	5.71%	N/A	8.43%
A	MGE Energy Inc	36.58	2.00	1.90	1.39	1.40	3.83%	0.50%	6.00%	5.47%	4.33%	9.83%
A	NStar	34.36	2.15	1.93	1.54	1.33	3.87%	8.00%	6.61%	6.26%	11.87%	10.48%
A	OGE Energy Corp	40.00	2.30	2.25	1.34	1.37	3.43%	2.00%	5.33%	5.75%	5.43%	8.76%
A	Otter Tail Corp	31.16	1.75	1.65	1.15	1.18	3.79%	3.00%	4.63%	5.62%	6.79%	8.42%
A	Scana Corp	40.62	2.75	2.65	1.68	1.72	4.23%	4.50%	4.14%	6.77%	8.73%	8.37%
A	Sempra	56.04	3.60	3.70	1.20	1.24	2.21%	4.50%	5.53%	6.42%	6.71%	7.75%
A	Southern Co	36.86	2.20	2.10	1.54	1.60	4.34%	4.00%	4.30%	5.97%	8.34%	8.64%
A	Vectren Corp	28.28	1.80	1.45	1.23	1.27	4.49%	3.00%	3.91%	6.36%	7.49%	8.40%
	Mean						3.93%	4.35%	5.18%	6.19%	7.70%	9.11%
	Median						3.98%	4.00%	4.47%	6.14%	7.14%	8.53%
	Weighted Average						- 12 0 7 0	,,,,,	, ,		8.54%	10.28%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column j represents the average estimated earnings growth extracted from Value Line, Zacks.com and ThomsonFN.com. Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
												_
B++	Green Mountain Power	33.89	2.25	2.10	1.12	1.18	3.48%	10.00%	3.50%	6.64%	13.48%	6.98%
B++	PG&E Corporation	47.33	2.70	2.50	1.34	1.42	3.00%	NMF	7.00%	5.70%	N/A	10.00%
B++	Wisconsin Energy	47.46	2.65	2.55	0.92	0.96	2.02%	4.50%	7.37%	5.58%	6.52%	9.39%
B+	DTE Energy Co	48.41	3.65	2.10	2.08	2.14	4.42%	2.00%	4.57%	7.54%	6.42%	8.99%
B+	El Paso Electric	24.37	1.65	1.30	Nil	Nil	0.00%	NMF	15.37%	6.77%	N/A	15.37%
B+	Empire District	24.69	1.45	1.15	1.28	1.28	5.18%	Nil	7.75%	5.87%	N/A	12.93%
B+	Northeast Utilities	28.16	1.45	1.60	0.73	0.78	2.77%	6.50%	10.13%	5.15%	9.27%	12.90%
B+	Puget Energy, Inc.	25.36	1.60	1.40	1.00	1.00	3.94%	1.50%	4.92%	6.31%	5.44%	8.86%
В	Avista Corporation	25.31	1.50	1.45	0.57	0.60	2.37%	12.50%	7.67%	5.93%	14.87%	10.04%
В	Centerpoint Energy	16.58	1.05	1.35	0.60	0.64	3.86%	NMF	8.80%	6.33%	N/A	12.66%
В	Central Vermont PS	23.55	1.50	1.40	0.92	0.92	3.91%	-1.00%	10.00%	6.37%	2.91%	13.91%
В	DPL Inc	27.78	1.50	1.45	1.00	1.04	3.74%	3.50%	5.49%	5.40%	7.24%	9.23%
В	Duquesne Light	19.85	1.20	0.55	1.00	1.00	5.04%	Nil	5.00%	6.05%	N/A	10.04%
В	Edison International	45.48	3.35	3.20	1.10	1.18	2.59%	NMF	7.50%	7.37%	N/A	10.09%
В	Sierra Pacific	16.83	0.80	1.25	Nil	Nil	0.00%	NMF	8.50%	4.75%	N/A	8.50%
	Mean						3.09%	4.94%	7.57%	6.12%	8.27%	10.66%
	Median						3.48%	4.00%	7.50%	6.05%	6.88%	10.04%
	Weighted Average										3.07%	10.36%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column j represents the average estimated earnings growth extracted from Value Line, Zacks.com and ThomsonFN.com. Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Equity Rates

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
-												<u> </u>
C++	Unisource Energy	36.53	1.85	1.80	0.84	0.92	2.52%	9.50%	8.50%	5.06%	12.02%	11.02%
C++	Allegheny Energy	45.91	2.15	1.80	Nil	0.60	0.00%	NMF	18.62%	4.68%	N/A	18.62%
	Mean						1.26%	9.50%	13.56%	4.87%	12.02%	14.82%
	Median						1.26%	9.50%	13.56%	4.87%	12.02%	14.82%
	Weighted Average										1.74%	17.51%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column j represents the average estimated earnings growth extracted from Value Line, Zacks.com and ThomsonFN.com. Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	С	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
A++	Consolidated Edison	2.00%	3.40%	3.07%	2.829
A+	Ameren	1.00%	6.10%	5.60%	4.239
A+	Exelon Corp	13.50%	8.70%	10.69%	10.969
A+	FPL Group Inc	8.50%	7.40%	7.81%	7.909
A	Allete	7.00%	8.50%	8.50%	8.009
A	CH Energy Group	3.00%	N/A	N/A	3.009
A	Great Plains Energy	-0.50%	3.50%	1.84%	1.619
A	Hawaiian Electric	3.00%	5.20%	3.38%	3.869
A	MGE Energy Inc	6.00%	N/A	N/A	6.009
A	NStar	7.50%	6.00%	6.33%	6.619
A	OGE Energy Corp	4.00%	5.00%	7.00%	5.339
A	Otter Tail Corp	4.00%	4.50%	5.40%	4.639
A	Scana Corp	3.50%	4.50%	4.42%	4.149
A	Sempra Energy	5.50%	5.40%	5.70%	5.539
A	Southern Co	3.50%	4.40%	5.00%	4.309
A	Vectren Corp	3.00%	4.00%	4.73%	3.919
B++	Green Mountain Power	3.50%	N/A	N/A	3.509
B++	PG&E Corp.	5.50%	7.80%	7.70%	7.009
B++	Wisconsin Energy	6.50%	7.80%	7.81%	7.379
B+	DTE Energy Co	3.00%	5.70%	5.00%	4.579
B+	El Paso Electric	21.50%	15.00%	9.60%	15.379
B+	Empire District	9.50%	N/A	6.00%	7.759
B+	Northeast Utilities	8.50%	10.50%	11.40%	10.139
B+	Puget Energy, Inc.	5.00%	N/A	4.83%	4.929
В	Avista Corporation	12.00%	5.50%	5.50%	7.679
В	Centerpoint Energy	NMF	7.10%	10.50%	8.809
В	Central Vermont PS	10.00%	N/A	N/A	10.009
В	DPL Inc	3.50%	6.30%	6.67%	5.49%

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
В	Duquesne Light	5.00%	N/A	N/A	5.00%
В	Edison International	8.00%	8.00%	6.50%	7.50%
В	Sierra Pacific	NMF	15.00%	15.00%	15.00%
C++	Unisource Energy	7.00%	10.00%	N/A	8.50%
C++	Allegheny Energy	NMF	15.90%	21.33%	18.62%
	Mean	6.10%	7.35%	7.31%	6.97%
	Median	5.25%	6.20%	6.33%	6.00%

Sources: Columns a, b, c were extracted from the November/December, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks Investment Research, Inc.

Column e was extracted from Thomson Network.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Value Line	Company	Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%	Ratio
A++	Consolidated Edison	246,466,627	48.07	11,847.65	8,063.00		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	20,123.25	40.1%	1.1%	58.9%	0.67
A+	Ameren	206,262,150	53.73	11,082.47	5,349.00	213.00	11,082.47	16,644.47	32.1%	1.3%	66.6%	0.47
A+	Exelon Corp	670,954,514	61.89	41,525.37	11,575.00	87.00	41,525.37	53,187.37	21.8%	0.2%	78.1%	0.28
A+	FPL Group Inc	404,746,671	54.42	22,026.31	9,631.00	0.00	22,026.31	31,657.31	30.4%	0.0%	69.6%	0.44
A	Allete	30,381,209	46.54	1,413.94	385.20	0.00	1,413.94	1,799.14	21.4%	0.0%	78.6%	0.27
A	CH Energy Group	15,762,000	52.80	832.23	310.90	21.00	832.23	1,164.13	26.7%	1.8%	71.5%	0.36
A	Great Plains Energy	80,303,446	31.80	2,553.65	752.30	39.00	2,553.65	3,344.95	22.5%	1.2%	76.3%	0.29
A	Hawaiian Electric	81,284,371	27.15	2,206.87	1,033.00	34.30	2,206.87	3,274.17	31.5%	1.0%	67.4%	0.46
A	MGE Energy Inc	20,670,572	36.58	756.13	207.40	0.00	756.13	963.53	21.5%	0.0%	78.5%	0.27
A	NStar	106,808,376	34.36	3,669.94	2,361.60	43.00	3,669.94	6,074.54	38.9%	0.7%	60.4%	0.64
A	OGE Energy Corp	91,139,901	40.00	3,645.60	1,221.50	0.00	3,645.60	4,867.10	25.1%	0.0%	74.9%	0.34
A	Otter Tail Corp	29,505,159	31.16	919.38	256.20	15.50	919.38	1,191.08	21.5%	1.3%	77.2%	0.27
A	Scana Corp	116,006,325	40.62	4,712.18	3,043.00	114.00	4,712.18	7,869.18	38.7%	1.4%	59.9%	0.63
A	Sempra	261,213,630	56.04	14,638.41	4,414.00	195.00	14,638.41	19,247.41	22.9%	1.0%	76.1%	0.30
A	Southern Co	742,286,154	36.86	27,360.67	13,190.00	595.60	27,360.67	41,146.27	32.1%	1.4%	66.5%	0.47
A	Vectren Corp	76,201,571	28.28	2,154.98	1,251.80	0.00	2,154.98	3,406.78	36.7%	0.0%	63.3%	0.58
	Mean								29.0%	0.8%	70.2%	0.42
	Median								28.6%	1.0%	70.5%	0.72
	Weighted Average								29.2%	0.7%	70.3%	
	" orgined Tiverage								27.2/0	0.7/0	70.170	

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Value Line	<b>)</b>	Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%	Ratio
B++	Green Mountain	5,294,461	33.89	179.43	93.90	0.00	179.43	273.33	34.4%	0.0%	65.6%	0.52
B++	PG&E	372,731,269	47.33	17,641.37	6,696.00	252.00	17,641.37	24,589.37	27.2%	1.0%	71.7%	0.37
B++	Wisconsin Energy	116,978,883	47.46	5,551.82	3,034.80	30.40	5,551.82	8,617.02	35.2%	0.4%	64.4%	0.54
$\mathbf{B}+$	DTE Energy Co	177,964,872	48.41	8,615.28	7,282.00	0.00	8,615.28	15,897.28	45.8%	0.0%	54.2%	0.85
$\mathbf{B}+$	El Paso Electric	48,457,840	24.37	1,180.92	612.30	0.00	1,180.92	1,793.22	34.1%	0.0%	65.9%	0.52
$\mathbf{B}+$	Empire District	30,190,017	24.69	745.39	462.60	0.00	745.39	1,207.99	38.3%	0.0%	61.7%	0.62
$\mathbf{B}+$	Northeast Utilities	153,798,675	28.16	4,330.97	2,945.00	116.20	4,330.97	7,392.17	39.8%	1.6%	58.6%	0.66
$\mathbf{B}+$	Puget Energy, Inc.	116,241,200	25.36	2,947.88	2,371.10	1.90	2,947.88	5,320.88	44.6%	0.0%	55.4%	0.80
В	Avista Corporation	49,082,419	25.31	1,242.28	933.80	26.30	1,242.28	2,202.38	42.4%	1.2%	56.4%	0.74
В	Centerpoint Energy	312,839,095	16.58	5,186.87	7,905.00	0.00	5,186.87	13,091.87	60.4%	0.0%	39.6%	1.52
В	Central Vermont PS	10,091,097	23.55	237.65	121.80	11.10	237.65	370.55	32.9%	3.0%	64.1%	0.49
В	DPL Inc	112,673,972	27.78	3,130.08	1,551.90	22.90	3,130.08	4,704.88	33.0%	0.5%	66.5%	0.49
В	Duquesne Light	87,612,654	19.85	1,739.11	1,557.70	148.20	1,739.11	3,445.01	45.2%	4.3%	50.5%	0.83
В	Edison International	325,811,206	45.48	14,817.89	9,232.00	915.00	14,817.89	24,964.89	37.0%	3.7%	59.4%	0.59
В	Sierra Pacific	200,921,764	16.83	3,381.51	4,403.70	0.00	3,381.51	7,785.21	56.6%	0.0%	43.4%	1.30
	3.6								40.50	1.00/	50 5°'	0.72
	Mean								40.5%		58.5%	0.72
	Median								38.3%		59.4%	
	Weighted Average								40.44%	1.25%	58.30%	

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Value Line	Company	Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%	Ratio
C++	Unisource Energy	35,162,573	36.53	1,284.49	1,835.80	0.00	1,284.49	3,120.29	58.8%	0.0%	41.2%	1.43
C++	Allegheny Energy	165,238,004	45.91	7,586.08	3,426.00	24.00	7,586.08	11,036.08	31.0%	0.2%	68.7%	0.45
	Mean								44.9%	0.1%	55.0%	0.94
	Median								44.9%	0.1%	55.0%	
	Weighted Average								37.2%	0.2%	62.6%	

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	с	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
A++	Consolidated Edison	0.75	0.17	0.11	0.34	0.67	0.54	0.06
A+	Ameren	0.75	0.34	0.36	0.48	0.47	0.58	0.04
A+	Exelon Corp	0.90	0.29	0.30	0.50	0.28	0.77	0.07
A+	FPL Group Inc	0.85	0.52	0.47	0.61	0.44	0.67	0.06
A	Allete	0.90	0.91	N/A	0.91	0.27	N/A	0.00
A	CH Energy Group	0.85	0.35	0.37	0.52	0.36	0.70	0.00
A	GT Plains Energy	0.95	0.87	0.77	0.86	0.29	0.81	0.00
A	Hawaiian Electric	0.70	0.38	N/A	0.54	0.46	0.55	0.01
A	MGE Energy Inc	0.75	0.53	0.53	0.60	0.27	0.64	0.00
A	OGE Energy Corp	0.75	0.55	N/A	0.65	0.64	0.54	0.02
A	NStar	0.80	0.49	0.50	0.60	0.34	0.67	0.01
A	Otter Tail Corp	0.65	0.48	N/A	0.57	0.27	0.56	0.00
A	Scana Corp	0.85	0.48	0.52	0.62	0.63	0.62	0.02
A	Sempra	1.10	0.87	0.80	0.92	0.30	0.93	0.03
A	Southern Co	0.70	-0.03	-0.10	0.19	0.47	0.55	0.09
A	Vectren Corp	0.90	0.51	N/A	0.71	0.58	0.67	0.01
	Mean	0.82	0.48	0.42	0.60	0.42	0.65	0.03
	Median	0.83	0.49	0.47	0.60	0.40	0.64	
	Weighted				0.50		0.66	
	Relevered Beta based on 50% D	ebt Capital Structure	and mean Unle	vered Beta 2				1.04
					d D 2			
	Relevered Beta based on 50% D	edi Capitai Structure	and a weighted	average Unievei	eu Beta			1.06

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

 $<sup>^{2}</sup>$  Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
B++	Green Mountain Power	0.60	0.18	0.25	0.34	0.52	0.46	0.0
B++	PG&E Corporation	1.15	1.01	0.97	1.04	0.37	0.94	0.1
B++	Wisconsin Energy	0.80	0.19	0.14	0.38	0.54	0.60	0.0
B+	DTE Energy Co	0.75	0.51	0.45	0.57	0.85	0.50	0.2
B+	El Paso Electric	0.70	0.25	0.22	0.39	0.52	0.53	0.02
B+	Empire District	0.80	0.68	N/A	0.74	0.62	0.58	0.0
B+	Northeast Utilities	0.90	0.44	0.34	0.56	0.66	0.64	0.10
B+	Puget Energy, Inc.	0.80	0.33	0.32	0.48	0.80	0.54	0.0
В	Avista Corporation	0.95	0.60	N/A	0.78	0.74	0.66	0.03
В	Centerpoint Energy	0.65	1.21	1.05	0.97	0.00	0.65	0.00
В	Central Vermont PS	0.70	0.42	N/A	0.56	0.00	0.70	0.00
В	DPL Inc	0.95	0.93	0.86	0.91	0.49	0.73	0.03
В	Duquesne Light	1.00	0.84	0.77	0.87	0.83	0.67	0.00
В	Edison International	1.15	0.82	0.81	0.93	0.59	0.85	0.29
В	Sierra Pacific	1.15	2.00	1.87	1.67	1.30	0.65	0.20
	Mean	0.87	0.69	0.67	0.75	0.59	0.65	0.0
	Median	0.80	0.60	0.61	0.74	0.59	0.65	
	Weighted				0.86		0.72	
	Relevered Beta based on 50% D	acht Canital Structur	o and maan Un	layarad Pata <sup>2</sup>				1.04
		•			2			
	Relevered Beta based on 50% D	ebt Capital Structur	e and a weighte	ed average Unle	vered Beta			1.16

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Gas and Electric Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
C++	Unisource Energy	0.75	0.54	0.54	0.61	1.43	0.40	0.32
C++	Allegheny Energy	2.10	1.29	1.19		0.45	1.00	0.35
	Mean	1.43	0.92	0.87	1.07	0.94	0.70	0.33
	Median	1.43	0.92	0.87	1.07	0.94	0.70	
	Weighted				1.32		0.87	
	Relevered Beta based on 50% De	ebt Capital S	tructure a	nd mean Un	levered Be	$ta^2$		1.12
	Relevered Beta based on 50% De	ebt Capital S	tructure aı	nd a weighte	ed average	Unlevered	Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.39

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equity				Preferred	Stock		Debt					
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted		
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate		
A, B++	11.12%	4.50%	11.64%	baa1	6.34%	1.70%	6.45%	A1	5.88%	1.70%	5.99%		
B+, B	11.35%	4.50%	11.88%	baa3	6.42%	1.70%	6.53%	A2	5.95%	1.70%	6.05%		
NR	12.16%	4.50%	12.73%					Baa2	6.18%	1.70%	6.29%		
								NR	7.03%	1.70%	7.15%		

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $\frac{k_u}{1 - f}$ 

Where:  $k_u$  = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Summary of Rates of Return

Value Line Rating A, B++	Rate of Return <sup>1</sup>	Moody's P/S Yields	Moody Rating	Rate of	Moody's Bond	Moody	Rate of
	Return <sup>1</sup>	Yields	Rating	D . 2		Moody	Rate of
A B++			Rating Return <sup>2</sup>		Yields	Rating	Return <sup>2</sup>
A B++							
A B++			aa1	6.22%	Aaa=N/A	Aaa2	5.54%
11, 2	11.12%	aa=N/A	aa2	6.23%		Aaa3	5.61%
			aa3	6.23%		Aa1	5.68%
B+, B	11.35%		a1	6.25%	Aa=5.75%	Aa	5.75%
		a=6.27%	a2	6.27%		Aa3	5.82%
$NR^3$	12.16%		a3	6.31%		A1	5.88%
			baa1	6.34%	A=5.95%	A2	5.95%
		baa=6.38%	baa2	6.38%		A3	6.03%
			baa3	6.42%		Baa1	6.10%
			ba1	6.45%	Baa=6.18%	Baa	6.18%
			ba2	6.49%		Baa3	6.29%
			ba3	6.53%		Ba1	6.39%
			b1	6.56%		Ba2	6.50%
			b2	6.60%		Ba3	6.61%
			b3	6.64%		B1	6.71%
			caa1	6.67%		B2	6.82%
			caa3	6.71%		В3	6.93%
						NR	7.03%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The Rate of Return on Common Equity was developed by staff based on the relative risk of the utilities in conjunction with the results of the various financial models and pertinent information from various sources.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Rates of Return on Preferred Stocks and Bonds were based on Moody's "Utility Preferred Stock Yields" and "Utility Bond Yields", December 2006 report. Because Moody assigns a yield to the groups Aaa, Aa, A and Baa for bonds; and aa, a, and baa for preferred stocks, the staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a further refinement of the ratings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For companies whose common equity are not rated (NR), staff judgment is used in assigning the rates of return because the circumstances or reasons for not rating the common equity are different for each company.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

	Value Line Ratings								
Component	A	B++	B+	В					
Expected Future Return, S&P 500	13.71%	13.71%	13.71%	13.71%					
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%					
Risk Premium	8.88%	8.88%	8.88%	8.88%					
Beta <sup>2</sup>	0.88	0.88	1.05	1.05					
Adjusted Risk Premium	7.81%	7.81%	9.34%	9.34%					
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%					
Projected Return on Common Equity	12.64%	12.64%	14.17%	14.17%					

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas are based on the gas and electric beta analysis. Staff is placing greater reliance on Value Line's mean beta.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

	Value Line Ratings							
Component	A	B++	B+	В				
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%	12.30%	12.30%	12.30%				
Less: Income-Long Term Government Bonds (1926-2006) 1	5.20%	5.20%	5.20%	5.20%				
Risk Premium	7.10%	7.10%	7.10%	7.10%				
Beta <sup>2</sup>	0.88	0.88	1.05	1.05				
Adjusted Risk Premium	6.25%	6.25%	7.47%	7.47%				
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%				
Projected Return on Common Equity	11.08%	11.08%	12.30%	12.30%				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas are based on the gas and electric beta analysis. Staff is placing greater reliance on Value Line's mean beta.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
A	Energen Corp.	46.94	4.00	3.15	0.44	0.48	1.02%	8.00%	7.06%	8.52%	1.02%	8.08%
A	Nicor Inc	46.80	2.72	2.70	1.86	1.90	4.06%	1.00%	3.29%	5.81%	5.06%	7.35%
A	New Jersey Resources	48.58	2.90	2.80	1.44	1.52	3.13%	4.50%	5.39%	5.97%	7.63%	8.52%
A	Northwest Natural Gas Co.	42.44	2.40	2.25	1.39	1.43	3.37%	4.00%	5.73%	5.66%	7.37%	9.10%
A	WGL Holdings	32.58	1.90	1.90	1.35	1.38	4.24%	2.00%	2.71%	5.83%	6.24%	6.95%
B++	AGL Resources	38.91	2.70	2.65	1.50	1.58	4.06%	6.50%	4.27%	6.94%	10.56%	8.33%
B++	Keyspan	41.18	2.40	2.35	1.86	1.90	4.61%	2.50%	2.48%	5.83%	4.61%	7.10%
B++	Peoples Energy	44.57	1.40	1.13	2.18	2.18	4.89%	Nil	5.25%	3.14%	N/A	10.14%
B++	Piedmont Natural Gas	26.75	1.40	1.30	0.96	1.00	3.74%	5.50%	5.25%	5.23%	9.24%	8.99%
B++	South Jersey Industries	33.41	1.95	1.85	0.92	0.98	2.93%	6.00%	6.44%	5.84%	8.93%	9.38%
	Mean						3.61%	4.44%	4.79%	5.88%	6.74%	8.39%
	Median Weighted Average						3.90%	4.50%	5.25%	5.83%	7.37% 5.52%	8.42% 8.03%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f and g were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

 $Column\ j\ represents\ the\ average\ estimated\ earnings\ growth\ extracted\ from\ Value\ Line,\ Zacks.com\ and\ ThomsonFN.com.$ 

Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
$\mathbf{B}+$	Atmos Energy Corp.	31.91	1.95	2.00	1.26	1.28	4.01%	2.00%	6.05%	6.11%	6.01%	10.06%
B+	Cascade Natural Gas	25.92	1.15	1.09	0.96	0.96	3.70%	0.50%	7.00%	4.44%	4.20%	10.70%
B+	Laclede Gas	35.03	2.15	2.37	1.40	1.45	4.14%	2.50%	5.00%	6.14%	6.64%	9.14%
B+	UGI Corporation	27.28	1.75	1.61	0.69	0.70	2.57%	3.00%	7.33%	6.41%	5.57%	9.90%
B+	Southern Union Co.	27.95	1.90	1.80	0.40	0.42	1.50%	NMF	8.75%	6.80%	N/A	10.25%
В	Southwest Gas Co.	38.37	2.00	1.95	0.82	0.82	2.14%	0.00%	8.98%	5.21%	2.14%	11.12%
C+	Semco Energy	6.10	0.35	0.22	Nil	Nil	N/A	NMF	16.67%	5.74%	N/A	N/A
	Mean						3.01%	1.60%	8.54%	5.84%	4.91%	10.20%
	Median						3.13%	2.00%	7.33%	6.11%	5.57%	10.16%
	Weighted Average										3.54%	9.99%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f and g were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

 $Column\ j\ represents\ the\ average\ estimated\ earnings\ growth\ extracted\ from\ Value\ Line,\ Zacks.com\ and\ ThomsonFN.com.$ 

Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Zacks	Thomson FN	Value Line	Average
A	Energen Corp.	7.50%	5.67%	8.00%	7.06%
A	Nicor	2.50%	3.37%	4.00%	3.29%
A	New Jersey Resources	6.00%	5.67%	4.50%	5.39%
A	Northwest Natural Gas Co.	5.30%	4.88%	7.00%	5.73%
A	WGL Holdings	3.30%	3.33%	1.50%	2.71%
B++	AGL Resources	4.60%	4.20%	4.00%	4.27%
B++	Keyspan	3.20%	2.75%	1.50%	2.48%
B++	Peoples Energy	4.00%	N/A	NMF	4.00%
B++	Piedmont Natural Gas	5.60%	4.15%	6.00%	5.25%
B++	South Jersey Industries	6.00%	6.33%	7.00%	6.44%
B+	Atmos Energy Corp.	5.50%	6.15%	6.50%	6.05%
B+	Cascade Natural Gas	N/A	N/A	7.00%	7.00%
B+	Laclede Gas	N/A	N/A	5.00%	5.00%
B+	UGI Corporation	8.00%	8.00%	6.00%	7.33%
B+	Southern Union Co.	7.50%	7.75%	11.00%	8.75%
В	Southwest Gas Co.	6.00%	11.95%	9.00%	8.98%
C+	Semco Energy	6.00%	23.00%	21.00%	16.67%
	Mean	5.40%	6.94%	6.81%	6.26%
	Median	5.60%	5.67%	6.25%	5.73%
	Weighted Average				6.98%

Sources: Columns a, b, e were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

Column c was extracted from Zacks Investment Research, Inc.

Column d was extracted from Thomson Network.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Capital Structure

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Value Line		Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%	ratio
A	Energen Corp.	72,355,003	46.94	3,396.34	682.90	0.00	3,396.34	4,079.24	16.74%	0.00%	83.26%	0.20
A	Nicor Inc	44,709,976	46.80	2,092.43	459.40	0.60	2,092.43	2,552.43	18.00%	0.02%	81.98%	0.22
A	New Jersey Resources	27,678,310	48.58	1,344.61	332.40	0.00	1,344.61	1,677.01	19.82%	0.00%	80.18%	0.25
A	Northwest Natural Gas Co.	27,504,896	42.44	1,167.31	492.00	0.00	1,167.31	1,659.31	29.65%	0.00%	70.35%	0.42
A	WGL Holdings	48,878,000	32.58	1,592.45	576.10	28.20	1,592.45	2,196.75	26.23%	1.28%	72.49%	0.36
B++	AGL Resources	77,696,090	38.91	3,023.15	1,634.00	0.00	3,023.15	4,657.15	35.09%	0.00%	64.91%	0.54
B++	Keyspan	175,283,247	41.18	7,218.16	3,919.00	0.00	7,218.16	11,137.16	35.19%	0.00%	64.81%	0.54
B++	Peoples Energy	38,471,441	44.57	1,714.67	893.60	0.00	1,714.67	2,608.27	34.26%	0.00%	65.74%	0.52
B++	Piedmont Natural Gas	75,327,139	26.75	2,015.00	825.00	0.00	2,015.00	2,840.00	29.05%	0.00%	70.95%	0.41
B++	South Jersey Industries	29,279,288	33.41	978.22	358.10	0.00	978.22	1,336.32	26.80%	0.00%	73.20%	0.37
	Mean Median Weighted Average								27.08% 27.92% 29.28%	0.13% 0.00% 0.08%	72.79% 71.72% 70.64%	0.38

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Capital Structure

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Value Line	Company	Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%	ratio
B+	Atmos Energy Corp.	81,595,723	31.91	2,603.72	2.180.80	0.00	2,603.72	4,784.52	45.58%	0.00%	54.42%	0.84
B+	Cascade Natural	11,505,996	25.92	298.24	165.30		298.24	463.54	35.66%	0.00%	64.34%	0.55
$\mathbf{B}+$	Laclede Gas	21,357,009	35.03	748.14	395.40	0.80	748.14	1,144.34	34.55%	0.07%	65.38%	0.53
B+	UGI Corporation	105,413,596	27.28	2,875.68	1,642.70	0.00	2,875.68	4,518.38	36.36%	0.00%	63.64%	0.57
B+	Southern Union Co.	119,638,350	27.95	3,343.89	1,632.00	230.00	3,343.89	5,205.89	31.35%	4.42%	64.23%	0.46
В	Southwest Gas Co.	41,464,506	38.37	1,590.99	1,366.10	0.00	1,590.99	2,957.09	46.20%	0.00%	53.80%	0.86
C+	Semco Energy	35,426,386	6.10	216.10	422.20	47.80	216.10	686.10	61.54%	6.97%	31.50%	1.60
	Mean								41.60%	1.64%	56.76%	0.77
	Median								36.36%	0.00%	63.64%	
	Weighted Average								39.50%	1.41%	59.09%	

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta 1	Ratio
A	Energen Corp.	0.85	0.50	0.39	0.58	0.20	0.76	0.02
A	Nicor Inc	1.30	0.89	0.85	1.01	0.22	1.15	0.02
A	New Jersey Resources	0.80	0.03	0.07	0.30	0.25	0.70	
A	Northwest Natural Gas Co.	0.75	0.14	0.15	0.35	0.42	0.60	
A	Peoples Energy	0.90	0.47	0.44	0.60	0.36	0.74	
A	WGL Holdings	0.85	0.27	0.27	0.46	0.54	0.64	0.07
B++	AGL Resources	0.95	0.38	0.36	0.56	0.54	0.72	0.17
B++	Keyspan	0.90	0.51	0.48	0.63	0.54	0.68	0.04
B++	Piedmont Nat'l	0.80	0.34	N/A	0.57	0.41	0.64	0.03
B++	South Jersey Industries	0.70	0.31	0.31	0.44	0.37	0.57	0.01
	Mean	0.88	0.38	0.37	0.55	0.38	0.72	0.04
	Median	0.85	0.36	0.36	0.57	0.39	0.69	
	Weighted				0.57		0.72	
	Relevered Beta based on 50% I	•			_			1.15
	Relevered Beta based on 50% I	Debt Capital Struct	ture and a weigh	nted average Un	nlevered Beta <sup>2</sup>			1.16

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Distribution Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
B+	Atmos Energy Corp.	0.80	0.45	0.28	0.51	0.84	0.53	0.17
B+	Cascade Natural	0.80	0.41	N/A	0.61	0.55	0.60	
B+	Laclede Gas	0.90	0.49	0.48	0.62	0.53	0.68	
B+	UGI Corporation	0.90	0.26	0.22	0.46	0.57	0.67	
B+	Southern Union Co.	1.05	1.26	1.08	1.13	0.46	0.82	0.10
В	Southwest Gas Co.	0.85	0.23	0.19	0.42	0.46	0.67	0.10
C+	Semco Energy	0.80	1.48	N/A	1.14	0.86	0.53	0.10
	Mean	0.87	0.65	0.45	0.70	0.61	0.64	0.09
	Median	0.85	0.45	0.28	0.61	0.55	0.67	
	Weighted				0.70		0.66	
	Relevered Beta based on 50%	Debt Capital Stru	cture and me	ean Unlevered	Beta <sup>2</sup>			1.03
	Relevered Beta based on 50%	=				Beta <sup>2</sup>		1.05

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equi	ty		Debt						
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted			
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate			
A, B++, B+	10.00%	4.50%	10.47%	A2	5.95%	1.70%	6.05%			

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $k_u$ 

Where:  $k_u =$ The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Summary of Rates of Return

Common	Equity		Preferred Stock			Bonds	
Value Line	Rate of	Moody's P/S	Moody	Rate of	Moody's Bond	Moody	Rate of
Rating	Return <sup>1</sup>	Yields	Rating	Return <sup>2</sup>	Yields	Rating	Return
A, B++, B+	10.00%		aa1	6.22%	Aaa=NA	Aaa2	5.54%
, - · · , - ·		aa=NA	aa2	6.23%		Aaa3	5.61%
			aa3	6.23%		Aa1	5.68%
			a1	6.25%	Aa=5.75%	Aa2	5.75%
		a=6.27%	a2	6.27%		Aa3	5.82%
			a3	6.31%		A1	5.88%
			baa1	6.34%	A=5.95%	A2	5.95%
		baa=6.38%	baa2	6.38%		A3	6.03%
			baa3	6.42%		Baa1	6.10%
			ba1	6.45%	Baa=6.18%	Baa2	6.18%
			ba2	6.49%		Baa3	6.29%
			ba3	6.53%		Ba1	6.39%
			b1	6.56%		Ba2	6.50%
			b2	6.60%		Ba3	6.61%
			b3	6.64%		B1	6.71%
			caa1	6.67%		B2	6.82%
			caa3	6.71%		В3	6.93%
						NR	7.03%

Note: Southern California Water Company (SCWC) is the principal subsidiary of American States Water Co. As a stand alone company, SCWC is not rated by Value Line. Because American States Water Co. is part of the pool in determining the A, B++, B+ rate of return, it is staff's judgement that SCWC, as the only NR coupany, should receive an A, B++, B+ rate of return.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> CPUC Decision 06-01-025 sets the cost of equity at 9.80% and authorized rate of return on rate base at 8.73% for Southern California Water Company.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Rates of Return on Preferred Stocks and Bonds were based on Moody's "Utility Preferred Stock Yields" and "Utility Bond Yields," December 2006 report. Because Moody assigns a yield to the groups Aaa, Aa, A and Baa for bonds; and aa, a, and baa for preferred stocks, the staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a further refinement of the ratings.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

	Value Line Ratings
Component	A, B++, B+
Expected Future Return, S&P 500	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%
Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.08
Adjusted Risk Premium	9.62%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	14.45%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated beta is based on staff's beta analysis.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

	Value Line Ratings
Component	A, B++, B+
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%
Less: Income-Long Term Government Bonds (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	5.20%
Risk Premium	7.10%
Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.08
Adjusted Risk Premium	7.69%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%
<b>Projected Return on Common Equity</b>	12.52%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated beta is based on staff's beta analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Equity Rates

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
B++	CA Water Service Group	40.40	1.60	1.40	1.15	1.16	2.87%	1.00%	7.89%	3.96%	3.87%	10.76%
B++	American States Water	38.62	1.60	1.50	0.91	0.92	2.38%	1.50%	7.50%	4.14%	3.88%	9.88%
B+	Aqua America	22.78	0.85	0.70	0.45	0.50	2.19%	12.00%	10.10%	3.73%	14.19%	12.29%
В	Southwest Water Company	13.76	0.45	0.35	0.22	0.24	1.74%	10.50%	11.50%	3.27%	12.24%	13.24%
	Mean						2.30%	6.25%	9.25%	3.78%	8.55%	11.55%
	Median						2.29%	6.00%	9.00%	3.85%	8.06%	11.53%
	Weighted Average										11.00%	11.78%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from the October 27, 2006 Value Line.

Column j represents the average estimated earnings growth extracted from Value Line, Zacks.com and ThomsonFN.com.

Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line					_
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
B++	CA Water Service Group	4.50%	9.50%	9.67%	7.89%
B++	American States Water	10.50%	6.00%	6.00%	7.50%
$\mathbf{B}+$	Aqua America	12.00%	7.70%	10.60%	10.10%
В	Southwest Water Company	13.50%	10.00%	11.00%	11.50%
	Mean	10.13%	8.30%	9.32%	9.25%
	Median	11.25%	8.60%	10.14%	9.00%
	Weighted Average				7.77%

Sources: Columns a, b, c were extracted from the October 27, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks Investment Research, Inc.

Column e was extracted from Thomson Network.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Capital Structure

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1
		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common
Value Line		Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity
Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	%	%	%
B++	CA Water Service Group	18,406,963	40.40	743.64	273.70	3.50	743.64	1,020.84	26.81%	0.34%	72.85%
B++	American States Water	16,981,858	38.62	655.84	268.20	0.00	655.84	924.04	29.02%	0.00%	70.98%
B+	Aqua America	131,396,751	22.78	2,993.22	907.20	0.00	2,993.22	3,900.42	23.26%	0.00%	76.74%
В	Southwest Water Compa	22,908,703	13.76	315.22	122.50	0.46	315.22	438.18	27.96%	0.11%	71.94%
	Mean								26.76%	0.11%	73.13%
	Median								27.38%	0.05%	72.39%
	Weighted Average								25.01%	0.06%	74.93%

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from October 27, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Yahoo Finance and represents 12/29/06 closing stock prices.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Water Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i			
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg			
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity			
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio			
B++	CA Water Service Group	0.85	0.64	N/A	0.75	0.37	0.70	0.06			
B++	American States Water	0.80	0.24	0.28	0.44	0.41	0.64	0.06			
B+	Aqua America	0.85	0.18	0.20	0.41	0.30	0.72	0.19			
В	Southwest Water Company	0.80	0.51	0.49	0.60	0.39	0.65	0.03			
	Mean	0.83	0.39	0.32	0.55	0.37	0.68	0.08			
	Median	0.83	0.38	0.28	0.52	0.38	0.67				
	Weighted				0.08		0.70				
	Relevered Beta based on 50% Debt Capital Structure and median unlevered Beta. <sup>2</sup>										
	Relevered Beta based on 50% Debt Capital structure and a weighted average Beta. <sup>2</sup>										

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies

		Rat	ings	Capital	Structure	Rates	of Return	Basic
				Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
153	Transwestern Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
180	North Baja Pipeline, LLC	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
187	Mojave Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
188	Kern River Gas Transmission Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
189	<b>Standard Pacific Gas Line Incorporated</b>	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
190	Tuscarora Gas Transmission Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
196	Questar Southern Trails Pipeline Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%
197	El Paso Natural Gas Company	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	12.04%	6.29%	10.60%

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Industry Notes

- Staff relied upon the results of the following models in the development of equity rates:
  - 1. Discounted Cash Flow
  - 2. Capital Asset Pricing Model Consideration was given to both the ex post and ex ante risk premiums
- Staff also considered the Cost of Capital Study prepared by Tegarden and Associates, Inc.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

				Bond							
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted				
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate				
Not Rated	11.50%	4.50%	12.04%	Not Rated	6.18%	1.70%	6.29%				

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $\frac{k_u}{1 - f}$ 

Where:  $k_u =$ The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Comparison of Return on Common Equity

	Valu	ie Line B++, B+, B, C	+
Description	2007	2006	Change
E/P Ratio - Mean	7.37%	7.75%	-0.38%
E/P Ratio - Median	6.43%	7.60%	-1.17%
Dividends Yield + Dividends Growth - Mean	9.72%	10.21%	-0.49%
Dividends Yield + Dividends Growth - Median	7.65%	10.57%	-2.92%
Dividends Yield + Earnings Growth - Mean	10.35%	11.61%	-1.26%
Dividends Yield + Earnings Growth - Median	10.97%	10.35%	0.62%
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Ante	12.82%	11.58%	1.24%
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Post	11.22%	10.98%	0.24%
State-Assessed Properties Division Recommendation:	11.50%	11.50%	0.00%

Interstate gas transmission companies are regulated by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC). California is the second largest natural gas market in the United States.

The Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) model is computed using data from a sample of gas transmission companies with similar risk and operations.

The information considered by staff includes the results of DCF analysis (Dividends Yield + Dividends Growth and Dividends Yield + Earnings Growth) and the results of the Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) analysis.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Equity Rates

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	2007			2007	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	Div Yld+	Div Yld+
Value Line	e	Price	Est.	2006	2006	Est.	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	Div Grwh	Engs Grwh
Rating	Company Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
<b>D</b>		60 6F	4.00	2.05	0.16	0.16	0.260/	4.500/	10.000/	6.600/	4.7.60/	10.050/
B+	Cabot Oil & Gas 'A'	60.65	4.00	3.85	0.16	0.16	0.26%	4.50%	10.69%	6.60%	4.76%	10.95%
B++	Devon Energy	67.08	7.50	6.70	0.45	0.45	0.67%	14.00%	8.96%	11.18%	14.67%	9.63%
B++	EOG Resources	62.45	5.60	5.35	0.24	0.28	0.45%	20.00%	10.54%	8.97%	20.45%	10.99%
B++	Equitable Resources	41.75	2.20	1.85	0.87	0.91	2.18%	7.50%	9.52%	5.27%	9.68%	11.70%
B++	National Fuel Gas	38.54	2.30	2.40	1.18	1.20	3.11%	2.50%	3.99%	5.97%	5.61%	7.11%
B++	Questar Corp.	83.05	5.20	4.65	0.93	0.94	1.13%	2.00%	10.61%	6.26%	3.13%	11.74%
	Mean Median Weighted Average						1.30% 0.90%	8.42% 6.00%	9.05% 10.03%	7.37% 6.43%	9.72% 7.65% 13.29%	10.35% 10.97% 10.23%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column c was extracted from the Yahoo Market Guide.

Column j is an average of Value Line, Zacks, and Thomson.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line	:				
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
B+	Cabot Oil & Gas 'A'	8.00%	11.80%	12.27%	10.69%
B++	Devon Energy	8.50%	7.90%	10.47%	8.96%
B++	EOG Resources	11.50%	10.10%	10.02%	10.54%
B++	Equitable Resources	9.00%	9.80%	9.75%	9.52%
B++	National Fuel Gas	1.50%	5.80%	4.68%	3.99%
B++	Questar Corp.	8.00%	12.00%	11.82%	10.61%
	Mean	7.75%	9.57%	9.84%	9.05%
	Median	8.25%	9.95%	10.25%	10.03%
	Weighted Average				9.31%

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Company Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

Component	Industry Computation
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%
Beta	0.90
Adjusted Risk Premium	7.99%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	12.82%

1.81%

11.90%

13.71%

Dividend Yield for S&P 500 December 30, 2006

5 Year projected growth per Merrill Lynch
Expected future return, S&P 500

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

Component	Industry Computation
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%
Less: Long Term Government Bonds <sup>1</sup>	5.20%
Risk Premium	7.10%
Beta	0.90
Adjusted Risk Premium	6.39%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	11.22%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line's	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
B+	Cabot Oil & Gas 'A'	1.00	0.76	0.60	0.79	0.13	0.73	0.006
B++	Devon Energy	1.05	0.48	0.34	0.62	0.23	0.55	0.116
B++	EOG Resources	1.05	0.53	0.50	0.69	0.05	0.67	0.011
B++	Equitable Resources	0.80	0.39	0.32	0.50	0.15	0.46	0.012
B++	National Fuel Gas	0.95	0.53	0.48	0.65	0.35	0.54	0.020
B++	Questar Corp.	0.90	0.69	0.66	0.75	0.14	0.69	0.016
	Mean	0.96	0.56	0.48	0.67	0.18	0.61	
	Median	0.98	0.53	0.49	0.67		0.61	
	Weighted				0.65		0.59	0.18
	Relevered Beta based on 259	% Debt Capital Str	ncture			0.73 <sup>2</sup>		

Relevered Beta based on 25% Debt Capital Structure and a weighted average Beta

 $0.71^{-2}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m	n
	Moody's	Moody's	S	Common	Common	Market Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total Cap.	L.T.	Pfd	Common
Value Line	Bond	P/S		Stock	Stock Price	Com. Stock	Debt	Stock	Stock	(\$mill)	Debt	Stock	Stock
Rating	Rating	Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(e * f)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(\$millions)	(h+i+j)	%	%	%
B+	NR	NR	Cabot Oil & Gas 'A'	47,914,159	60.65	2,905.99	380.00	0.00	2,905.99	3,285.99	11.60%	0.00%	88.40%
B++	NR	NR	Devon Energy	442,001,000	67.08	29,649.43	6,800.00	150.00	29,649.43	36,599.43	18.60%	0.40%	81.00%
B++	NR	NR	EOG Resources	243,471,673	62.45	15,204.81	705.40	99.20	15,204.81	16,009.41	4.40%	0.60%	95.00%
B++	NR	NR	Equitable Resources	120,772,379	41.75	5,042.25	753.40	0.00	5,042.25	5,795.65	13.00%	0.00%	87.00%
B++	NR	NR	National Fuel Gas	83,400,866	38.54	3,214.27	1,111.70	0.00	3,214.27	4,325.97	25.70%	0.00%	74.30%
B++	NR	NR	Questar Corp.	85,865,721	83.05	7,131.15	1,032.40	0.00	7,131.15	8,163.55	12.60%	0.00%	87.40%
			Mean								14.32%		85.52%
			Median Weighted Average								12.80% 14.54%	0.00% 0.33%	87.20% 85.13%

Sources: Columns a, d, e, h and i were extracted from the December 15, 2006 Value Line.

Columns b and c were extracted from the 2006 Moody's Public Utility and Industrial Manuals.

Column f was extracted from the Yahoo Market Guide.

#### NR - Not Rated

Note: It is staff's opinion that the appropriate capital structure would contain more debt financing than is reflected in the above sample. The common stock prices in the sample are reflecting the increase in the price of natural gas over last year. In determining the capital structure for a company operating pipeline assets, the increase in the equity value due to the increase in natural gas inventories or reserves should not be reflected in the capital structure chosen for the pipeline assets.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Natural Gas Transmission Companies

### **Bonds - Rate of Return**

	Bond Rating								
Utility Bond Yield	Aaa	Aa	A	Baa	Avg Utility				
As of December 29, 2006	N/A	5.75%	5.95%	6.18%	5.96%				

Staff applied a bond rating of Baa2 for the Natural Gas Transmission Companies, which represents the estimated cost of debt for the companies in the study.

Source: Moody's Public Utility, Credit Market Trends Service.

# California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies

		Ratir	ngs	Capital Struc	cture	Rates of	Return	Basic
				Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
279	Pacific Bell Telephone Company	A+	A2	80%	20%	12.30%	6.05%	11.05%
201	Verizon California, Inc.	A+	A3	80%	20%	12.30%	6.13%	11.07%
294	SureWest Telephone	В	Not Rated	70%	30%	13.35%	6.29%	11.23%
284	Citizens Telecommunications Co. of California, Inc.	В	Not Rated	70%	30%	13.35%	6.29%	11.23%
	Other Local Exchange Companies	Not Rated	Not Rated	70%	30%	14.66%	6.94%	12.35%

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Industry Summary

- Staff relied on the following models in the development of equity rates:
  - 1. Discounted Cash Flow (DCF) Staff considered the weighted average dividend yield plus earnings growth.
  - 2. Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) Staff also considered both the ex ante and ex post risk premiums.
- Staff's recommended rate of return for common equity for lien date 2007 was based on the relative risk of the companies included
  in the sample in conjunction with the results of the various financial models. The data and/or information considered by staff
  include the results of the DCF analysis (Dividend Yield plus Dividend Growth and Dividend Yield plus Earnings Growth) and the
  CAPM analysis, and the spreads between utility bond yields. Due to recent merger activities impacting the telecommunications
  industry, staff placed most reliance on the results of the CAPM Ex Post and DCF analysis and less reliance on CAPM Ex Ante.
- The following companies were added to the 2007 Capitalization Rate Study sample:

Embarq Corp. – This company represents the former local wireline operations of Sprint Nextel, which was spun off on May 17, 2006.

Windstream Corporation – This company represents the former wireline operations of ALLTEL Corp., which was spun off on July 17, 2006, and then merge with VALOR Communications.

• The following company was not included in the 2007 Capitalization Rate Study sample:

ALLTEL Corp. – This company is now a pure play wireless service provider as a result of the spin off of its wireline operations on July 17, 2006, and then merged with VALOR Communications to form Windstream Corporation.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equit	ot					
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moodys	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate
A+	11.75%	4.50%	12.30%	Aa2	5.75%	1.70%	5.85%
NR-1	12.75%	4.50%	13.35%	Aa3	5.82%	1.70%	5.92%
NR-2	14.00%	4.50%	14.66%	A1	5.88%	1.70%	5.99%
				A2	5.95%	1.70%	6.05%
				A3	6.03%	1.70%	6.13%
				Baa1	6.10%	1.70%	6.21%
				Baa2	6.18%	1.70%	6.29%
				Not Rated	6.83%	1.70%	6.94%

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs = 
$$k_u$$
1 - f

Where:  $k_u = \text{The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs}$ 

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

NR-1: Although no ratings were available for state-assessed companies, a Value Line rating of B was applied to the equity and a Moody bond rating of Baa2 was applied to represent the debt for companies with a value between \$50 million - \$300 million.

NR-2: Although no ratings were available for state-assessed companies, the Value Line rating of lower than B was applied to the equity and a staff estimate was used for the debt for companies with a value less than \$50 Million.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Comparison of Return On Common Equity

		A+, A			B++, B+, B	
Description	2007	2006	Change	2007	2006	Change
E/P Ratio - Mean	6.39%	7.24%	-0.85%	6.93%	5.59%	1.34%
E/P Ratio - Median	6.85%	7.27%	-0.43%	6.67%	4.50%	2.17%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Mean	6.83%	7.80%	-0.97%	5.10%	3.76%	1.34%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Median	6.47%	7.40%	-0.93%	5.10%	4.75%	0.34%
Weighted Average (Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Mean)	6.59%	7.93%	-1.35%	0.89%	3.66%	-2.77%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Mean	10.40%	10.22%	0.18%	8.96%	13.02%	-4.06%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Median	10.14%	10.31%	-0.17%	8.87%	15.10%	-6.24%
Weighted Average (Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Mean)	10.62%	9.96%	0.66%	9.01%	13.46%	-4.45%

			Lower
	A+, A	B++, B+, B	than B
CAPM Analysis - Ex Ante			
2007 Lien Date	15.65%	13.17%	NMF
2006 Lien Date	12.20%	11.57%	NMF
Change	3.45%	1.60%	NMF
CAPM Analysis - Ex Post			
2007 Lien Date	13.48%	11.49%	NMF
2006 Lien Date	11.54%	10.97%	NMF
Change	1.94%	0.53%	NMF
Discounted Cash Flow			
2007 Lien Date	10.62%	9.01%	NMF
2006 Lien Date	9.96%	13.46%	NMF
Change	0.66%	-4.45%	NMF
2007 Recommended Rate	11.75%	12.75%	14.00%
2006 SBE Rate	11.50%	12.50%	13.75%
Change	0.25%	0.25%	0.25%

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DivYld+	DivYld+
Value Line	Company	Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DivGrw	ErngsGrw
Rating	Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
A+	AT&T Inc.	35.75	2.55	2.33	1.33	1.42	3.97%	2.50%	9.59%	7.13%	6.47%	13.57%
A+	BellSouth Corp.	47.11	2.45	2.05	1.18	1.26	2.67%	6.50%	7.47%	5.20%	9.17%	10.14%
A+	Verizon Communications	37.24	2.55	2.55	1.62	1.62	4.35%	0.50%	3.14%	6.85%	4.85%	7.49%
	Mean						3.67%	3.17%	6.73%	6.39%	6.83%	10.40%
	Median						3.97%	2.50%	7.47%	6.85%	6.47%	10.14%
	Weighted Average										6.59%	10.62%
B++	CenturyTel Inc.	43.66	2.60	2.45	0.25	0.26	0.60%	4.50%	4.13%	5.96%	5.10%	4.73%
	Citizens Communications	14.37	0.70	0.64	1.00	1.00	6.96%	NMF	6.41%	4.87%	N/A	13.37%
	Embarq Corp. <sup>1</sup>	52.56	5.00	5.00	1.00	2.20	4.19%	NMF	3.83%	9.51%	N/A	8.01%
	Windstream Corporation <sup>2</sup>	14.22	1.05	1.02	0.00	1.00	7.03%	NMF	2.69%	7.38%	N/A	9.72%
	Mean						4.69%	4.50%	4.27%	6.93%	5.10%	8.96%
	Median						5.57%	4.50%	3.98%	6.67%	5.10%	
	Weighted Average										0.89%	

Sources: Columns a, d,e, f, g, i, were extracted from the December 29, 2006 Value Line.

Column c as of December 29, 2006, The Wall Street Journal.

Column j was extracted from the long term earnings growth page of the 2007 capitalization rate study for local exchange companies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Company represents the former local wireline operations of Sprint Nextel, which was spun off on May 17, 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Company represents the former wireline operations of ALLTEL Corp., which was spun off on July 17, 2006, and then merge with VALOR Communications.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Avarag
Kating	Company Name	value Lille	Zacks	HOHISOH	Average
A+	AT&T Inc.	11.50%	7.60%	9.68%	9.59%
A+	BellSouth Corp.	9.50%	6.00%	6.90%	7.47%
A+	Verizon Communications	2.00%	3.60%	3.83%	3.14%
	Mean	7.67%	5.73%	6.80%	6.73%
	Median	9.50%	6.00%	6.90%	7.47%
	Weighted Average				6.84%
B++	CenturyTel Inc.	2.00%	6.70%	3.70%	4.13%
В	Citizens Communications	11.00%	3.90%	4.34%	6.41%
В	Embarq Corp. <sup>1</sup>	NIL	4.40%	3.25%	3.83%
В	Windstream Corporation <sup>2</sup>	NMF	-	2.69%	2.69%
	Mean	6.50%	5.00%	3.76%	4.79%
	Median	6.50%	4.40%	3.70%	4.13%
	Weighted Average				4.07%

Sources: Columns a, c were extracted from the December 29, 2006 Value Line.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com on December 29, 2006.

Column e was extracted from ThomsonFN.com on December 29, 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Company represents the former local wireline operations of Sprint Nextel, which was spun off on May 17, 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Company represents the former wireline operations of ALLTEL Corp., which was spun off on July 17, 2006, and then merge with VALOR Communications.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Common	Common	Market	Long Term	Preferred	Common	Total	L.T.	Preferred	Common	Value
Value Line	Company	Stock	Stock Price	Value	Debt	Stock	Stock	Capital	Debt	Stock	Stock	Line
Rating	Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	Common	(\$Million)	(\$Million)	(\$Million)	(\$Million)	%	%	%	Page
A+	AT&T Inc.	3,842,900,000	35.75	137,383.68	26,799.00	0.00	137,383.68	164,182.68	16.32%	0.00%	83.68%	719
A+	BellSouth Corp.	1,824,067,817	47.11	85,931.83	14,278.00	0.00	85,931.83	100,209.83	14.25%	0.00%	85.75%	
A+	Verizon Communications	2,919,515,293	37.24	108,722.75	30,154.00	0.00	108,722.75	138,876.75	21.71%	0.00%	78.29%	
	Mean			110,679.42				403,269.26	17.43%	0.00%	82.57%	
	Median			108,722.75				ŕ	16.32%	0.00%	83.68%	
	Weighted Average			,					17.66%	0.00%	82.34%	
B++	Continue Tal In a	115 400 000	12.66	5.029.26	2 417 90	7.50	5 029 26	7 462 66	22 200/	0.10%	67.51%	724
	CenturyTel Inc. Citizens Communications	115,400,000	43.66	5,038.36	2,417.80	7.50	5,038.36	7,463.66	32.39%			
B B	Embarq Corp. <sup>1</sup>	321,895,531 149,490,309	14.37 52.56	4,625.64 7,857.21	3,947.70 6,506.00	0.00 0.00	4,625.64 7,857.21	8,573.34 14,363.21	46.05% 45.30%	0.00% 0.00%	53.95% 54.70%	
В	SureWest Communications	14,456,000	27.54	398.12	125.50	0.00	398.12	523.62	23.97%	0.00%	76.03%	
В	Telephone & Data Systems	115,660,889	54.33	6,283.86	3,340.80	3.90	6,283.86	9,628.56	34.70%	0.00%	65.26%	
В	Windstream Corporation <sup>2</sup>	476,778,215	14.22	6,779.79	5,477.40	0.0	6,779.79	12,257.19	44.69%	0.00%	55.31%	
	Mean			5,163.83				52,809.57	37.85%	0.02%	62.13%	
	Median			5,661.11					39.69%	0.00%	60.29%	
	Weighted Average			- ,					41.31%	0.02%	58.67%	

Sources: Columns a, c, f and g were extracted from Value Line.

Capital structure as of September 30, 2006 except for Telephone & Data Systems (TDS); TDS capital structure as of December 31, 2005. Column d as of December 29, 2006, The Wall Street Journal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Company represents the former local wireline operations of Sprint Nextel, which was spun off on May 17, 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Company represents the former wireline operations of ALLTEL Corp., which was spun off on July 17, 2006, and then merge with VALOR Communications.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

	Value L	ine Rating
Component	A+, A	B++, B+, B
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return, 25-30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%
Ex Ante Risk Premium	8.88%	8.88%
Relevered Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.22	0.94
Adjusted Risk Premium	10.82%	8.34%
Risk Free Return, 25-30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%
Projected Equity Yield	15.65%	13.17%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>Expected Future Return for S&P 500 Companies:

Dividend Yield for S&P 500 Companies as of December 29, 2006	1.81%
Next 5 Years Estimated Earnings Growth for S&P 500 Companies - Merrill Lynch	11.90%
Total Expected Future Return for S&P 500 Companies	13.71%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas are derived from a representative sample of local exchange companies with similar ratings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> As of December 29, 2006, The Wall Street Journal.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

	Value L	ine Rating
Component	A+, A	B++, B+, B
Common Stock Return (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%	12.30%
Less: Income - Long Term Government Bonds (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	5.20%	5.20%
Ex Post Risk Premium	7.10%	7.10%
Relevered Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.22	0.94
Adjusted Risk Premium	8.65%	6.66%
Risk Free Return, 25-30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%
Projected Equity Yield	13.48%	11.49%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 2007 Ibbotson Associates Study (Total Returns, Income Returns and Capital Appreciation, Table 1)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas are derived from a representative sample of local exchange companies with similar ratings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> As of December 29, 2006 Wall Street Journal.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Local Exchange Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	с	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value				Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta 1	Ratio
A+	AT&T Inc.	1.20	1.56	0.88	1.21	0.20	1.09	0.08
A+	BellSouth Corp.	1.10	1.77	0.89	1.25	0.17	1.14	0.04
A+	Verizon Communications	1.05	1.39	0.95	1.13	0.28	0.97	0.10
	Mean	1.12	1.57	0.91	1.20	0.21	1.06	
	Median	1.10	1.56	0.89	1.21		1.09	
	Weighted				1.19		1.06	0.22
B++	CenturyTel Inc.	1.00	1.30	0.66	0.99	0.48	0.77	0.14
В	Citizens Communications	1.00	1.59	0.59	1.06	0.85	0.70	0.28
В	SureWest Communications	1.20	1.89	1.86	1.65	0.32	1.39	0.01
В	Telephone & Data Systems	1.05	1.14	0.73	0.97	0.53	0.74	0.20
	Mean	1.06	1.48	0.96	1.17	0.55	0.90	
	Median	1.03	1.45	0.70	1.02		0.75	
	Weighted				1.02		0.75	0.62
					A+, A	B++, B+, B		
A+, A:	Relevered beta based on 20% d	ebt capital structu	ıre		1.22 2			
	Relevered beta based on 20% d	•		d average beta	1.22 2			

Sources: Columns a, c were extracted from the December 29, 2006 Value Line.

B++, B+, B: Relevered beta based on 30% debt capital structure

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com on December 29, 2006.

Column e was extracted from ThomsonFN.com on December 29, 2006.

Relevered beta based on 30% debt capital structure and a weighted average beta

 $1.13^{-2}$ 

 $0.94^{-2}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Value Line Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities

	Rat	tings	cs Capital Structure			Return	Basic	
			Common		Common		Cap	
Facility Type	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate <sup>4</sup>	
Recently Constructed Facilities <sup>1</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	15.71%	6.83%	12.16%	
a								
Composite Facilities <sup>2</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	17.02%	7.34%	13.14%	
Older Facilities <sup>3</sup>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	17.80%	7.85%	13.82%	
Oluci Facilities	C+	noi Rated	00%	40%	17.80%	1.63%	13.0270	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Recently Constructed Facilities - Facilities constructed after September 1996 incorporating modern electric generation technologies at the time they were built.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Composite Facilities - Facilities that were sold off by vertically integrated electric utilities and for which replacements of some obsolete generation units with modern electric generation technologies have been made.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Older Facilities - Facilities that were sold off by vertically integrated electric utilities and for which no replacements, other than for routine maintenance, have been made.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Staff may adjust the rates stated above if the specific situation of a facility warrants an adjustment to its basic capitalization rate.

### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Industry Notes

- The available information with respect to the capital structure, rates of return, and statistics based on historical operating results
  and market performance is not reliable due to the small number of pure play electric generation companies and the distressed
  nature of the surviving companies.
- Staff's recommended capital structure of 60% equity and 40% debt recognizes that a prospective purchaser of an electric generation plant would not be able to employ the high level of debt currently maintained by the Merchant Generators in the sample. The capital structure selected provides sufficient coverage of interest and principal payments on the debt.
- Staff added a risk premium of 100 basis points to the debt rate of older facilities and 50 basis points to the debt rate of the composite facilities to recognize the market's perception of additional risk present in various facility types in this industry.
- The beta used by staff in calculating the risk of electric generation facilities relative to the risk of the overall market reflects that a prospective purchaser using the recommended capital structure would be subject to less financial risk than Merchant Generator companies in the sample and more risk than Diversified Electric Utility companies in the sample.
- The following companies were added to the 2007 Capitalization Rate Study sample for electric generation companies:
  - 1. Constellation Energy Group, Inc.
  - 2. Dynegy, Inc.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Flotation Cost Adjustment

		Equity			Debt			
Facility	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted		
Type	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rate	Cost in %	Rate		
Recently Constructed Facilities <sup>1</sup>	15.00%	4.50%	15.71%	6.71%	1.70%	6.83%		
Composite Facilities <sup>2</sup>	16.25%	4.50%	17.02%	7.21%	1.70%	7.34%		
Older Facilities <sup>3</sup>	17.00%	4.50%	17.80%	7.71%	1.70%	7.85%		

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $k_u$ 1 - f

Where:  $k_u$  = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> B1 bond rating

 $<sup>^2</sup>$  B1 bond rating with an additional risk premium of 50 basis points (0.5%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> B1 bond rating with an additional risk premium of 100 basis points (1.0%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Summary of Rates of Return

Common I	Equity		Bonds	
Facility	Rate of	Moody's Bond	Moody	Rate of
Туре	Return <sup>1</sup>	Yields	Rating	Return <sup>2</sup>
Recently Constructed Facilities	15.00%	Aaa=NA	Aaa2	5.54%
			Aaa3	5.61%
Composite Facilities	16.25%		Aa1	5.68%
		Aa=5.75%	Aa2	5.75%
Older Facilities	17.00%		Aa3	5.82%
			A1	5.88%
		A=5.95%	A2	5.95%
			A3	6.03%
			Baa1	6.10%
		Baa=6.18%	Baa2	6.18%
			Baa3	6.29%
			Ba1	6.39%
			Ba2	6.50%
			Ba3	6.61%
			B1	6.71%
			B2	6.82%
			В3	6.93%
			Caa1	7.03%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Rate of Return on Common Equity was developed by staff based on the relative risk of the utilities in conjunction with the results of the various financial models and pertinent information from various sources.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Rates of Return on Bonds are based on Moody's "Utility Bond Yields" as of December 2006. However, because Moody assigns a yield to the groups Aa, A and Baa for bonds, the staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a further refinement of the ratings.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Comparison of Rates of Return on Common Equity

	A	Il Facilities in Stud	ly
	2007	2006	Change
E/P Ratio-Mean	4.62%	4.82%	-0.20%
E/P Ratio-Median	5.72%	6.38%	-0.66%
Div Yld + Div Growth-Mean	5.59%	4.59%	1.00%
Div Yld + Div Growth-Median	6.71%	7.18%	-0.47%
Weighted Average - Mean	7.35%	6.10%	1.25%
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Mean	9.11%	10.03%	-0.92%
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Median	8.35%	9.81%	-1.46%
Weighted Average - Mean	10.17%	10.54%	-0.37%
ROE% - Yahoo Finance - Utilities	13.46%	13.72%	-0.26%
ROE% - Yahoo Finance - Electric Utilities	10.80%	10.40%	0.40%
ROE% - Yahoo Finance - Diversified Utilities	11.30%	N/A	N/A
_			
	Recently		
-	Constructed	Composite	Older
2006 Recommended Rate	14.30%	15.47%	16.25%
CAPM - Ex Ante	17.26%	19.04%	19.93%
CAPM - Ex Post	14.77%	16.19%	16.90%
CHINI BATON	11.7770	10.17/0	10.50%
2007 Recommended Rate	15.00%	16.25%	17.00%

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

		Types of Facilities	
Component	Recently Constructed	Composite	Older
Expected Future Return, S&P 500	13.71%	13.71%	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%	8.88%	8.88%
Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.40	1.60	1.70
Adjusted Risk Premium	12.43%	14.21%	15.10%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>1</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%
<b>Projected Return on Common Equity</b>	17.26%	19.04%	19.93%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The betas are based on staff's judgement in conjunction with the results of the Beta Analysis. See explanation contained in the Industry Notes.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

		<b>Types of Facilities</b>		
Component	Recently Constructed	Composite	Older	
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%	12.30%	12.30%	
Less: Long Term Government Bonds <sup>1</sup>	5.20%	5.20%	5.20%	
tisk Premium	7.10%	7.10%	7.10%	
eta <sup>2</sup>	1.40	1.60	1.70	
djusted Risk Premium	9.94%	11.36%	12.07%	
tisk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%	4.83%	
Projected Return on Common Equity	14.77%	16.19%	16.90%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The betas are based on staff's judgement in conjunction with the results of the Beta Analysis. See explanation contained in the Industry Notes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			Est.	Dividend	Est.	Est.	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line		Price	2007	2006	2006	2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Company Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
	Merchant Generators											
C++	AES Corp.	22.04	1.20	1.10	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00%	8.35%	5.44%	0.00%	8.35%
C+	Reliant Energy Inc.	14.21	0.20	(0.25)	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00%	5.00%	1.41%	0.00%	5.00%
C	Dynegy, Inc.	7.24	0.05	(0.85)	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00%	7.00%	0.69%	0.00%	7.00%
	Diversified Electric Utilit	<u>ties</u>										
A	Duke Energy Corp.	33.21	1.90	1.70	1.26	1.30	3.91%	5.00%	7.14%	5.72%	8.91%	11.06%
A	Constellation Egy. Grp.	68.87	4.55	3.95	1.51	1.68	2.44%	11.50%	12.60%	6.61%	13.94%	15.04%
A	Sempra Energy	56.04	3.60	3.70	1.20	1.24	2.21%	4.50%	5.53%	6.42%	6.71%	7.75%
B++	Xcel Energy Inc.	23.06	1.40	1.35	0.88	0.93	4.03%	5.50%	5.57%	6.07%	9.53%	9.60%
	Mean						1.80%	3.79%	7.31%	4.62%	5.59%	9.11%
	Median						2.21%	4.50%	7.00%	5.72%	6.71%	8.35%
	Weighted Average										7.35%	10.17%

 $Sources:\ Columns\ a,\ b,\ d,\ e,\ f,\ g\ and\ i\ were\ extracted\ from\ the\ Value\ Line\ Investment\ Survey\ Reports.$ 

Column j represents the average estimated earnings growth extracted from Value Line, Zacks.com and ThomsonFN.com.

Column c was extracted from CNNMoney.com and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
	Merchant Generators				
C++	AES Corp.	0.50%	11.30%	13.25%	8.35%
C+	Reliant Energy Inc.	N/A	6.50%	3.50%	5.00%
C	Dynegy, Inc.	N/A	8.00%	6.00%	7.00%
	Diversified Electric Utilities				
A	Duke Energy Corp.	9.50%	5.60%	6.33%	7.14%
A	Constellation Egy. Grp.	13.00%	12.30%	12.50%	12.60%
A	Sempra Energy	5.50%	5.40%	5.70%	5.53%
B++	Xcel Energy Inc.	6.00%	4.30%	6.40%	5.57%
	Mean	6.90%	7.63%	7.67%	7.31%
	Median	6.00%	6.50%	6.33%	7.00%
	Weighted Average				7.46%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Capital Structure

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
Value		Common	Common	Mkt Value	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Total	L.T.	Pfd	Common	Debt
Line		Stock	Stock Price	Equity	Debt	Stock	Equity	Capital	Debt	Stock	Equity	Equity
Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(000)	(000)	(000)	(000)	(000)	%	%	%	Ratio
	Merchant Generators											
C++	AES Corp.	664,188,411	22.04	14,638.71	15,387.00	0.00	14,638.71	30,025.71	51.25%	0.00%	48.75%	1.05
C+	Reliant Energy Inc.	308,488,738	14.21	4,383.62	4,095.50	0.00	4,383.62	8,479.12	48.30%	0.00%	51.70%	0.93
C	Dynegy, Inc.	337,195,778	7.24	2,441.30	2,320.00	0.00	2,441.30	4,761.30	48.73%	0.00%	51.27%	0.95
	Mean								49.42%	0.00%	50.58%	0.98
	Median								48.73%	0.00%	51.27%	0.95
	Weighted Average								50.39%	0.00%	49.61%	1.02
	Diversified Electric Utilitie	<u>es</u>										
A	Duke Energy Corp.	1,255,275,068	33.21	41,687.69	18,678.00	0.00	41,687.69	60,365.69	30.94%	0.00%	69.06%	0.45
A	Constellation Egy. Grp.	180,007,617	68.87	12,397.12	3,515.90	190.00	12,397.12	16,103.02	21.83%	1.18%	76.99%	0.28
A	Sempra Energy	261,213,630	56.04	14,638.41	4,414.00	195.00	14,638.41	19,247.41	22.93%	1.01%	76.05%	0.30
B++	Xcel Energy Inc.	405,967,399	23.06	9,361.61	6,237.10	105.00	9,361.61	15,703.71	39.72%	0.67%	59.61%	0.66
	Mean								28.86%	0.72%	70.43%	0.42
	Median								26.94%	0.84%	72.56%	0.37
	Weighted Average								29.48%	0.44%	70.08%	0.43

Sources: Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from the Value Line Investment Survey Reports.

Column d was extracted from CNNMoney.com and represents December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Electric Generation Facilities Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i
Financial		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Strength		Line's	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Value Line	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
	Merchant Generator							
C++	AES Corp.	2.05	2.40	2.41	2.29	1.05	1.40	0.73
C+	Reliant Energy Inc.	1.70	2.96	2.98	2.55	0.93	1.63	0.18
C	Dynegy, Inc.	2.85	3.11	3.12	3.03	0.95	1.93	0.10
	Mean	2.20	2.82	2.84	2.62	0.98	1.65	
	Median	2.05	2.96	2.98	2.55		1.63	
	Weighted				2.42		1.51	
	Diversified Electric Utility							
A	Duke Energy Corp.	1.30	1.25	1.23	1.26	0.45	0.99	0.24
A	Constellation Egy. Grp.	0.95	0.53	0.53	0.67	0.28	0.57	0.04
A	Sempra Energy	1.10	0.87	0.89	0.95	0.30	0.81	0.05
B++	Xcel Energy Inc.	0.90	1.47	1.48	1.28	0.66	0.92	0.09
	Mean	1.06	1.03	1.03	1.04	0.42	0.82	
	Median	1.03	1.06	1.06	1.11		0.86	
	Weighted				1.13		0.89	
	Merchant Generators Relev	vered Reta hased	on 40% Debt Ca	nital Structure		2.11	2	
				=			2	
	Diversified Electric Utilitie	s Relevered Beta	a based on 30% D	Debt Capital Structu	ıre	1.12	2	

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from the Value Line Investment Survey Reports.

Column d was extracted from Zacks.com.

Column e was extracted from Standard and Poor's Stock Reports.

Column g was extracted from capital structure worksheet.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies

		Ratings		Capital	Structure	Rates of Return		Basic
				Common	Long Term	Common	Long Term	Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
2310	AT&T Communications, Inc.	A+	A2	75%	25%	14.14%	6.05%	12.12%
2014	Sprint Communications Co., L.P.	B+	Baa3	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
2274	MCIWorldCom Network Services, Inc.	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
2372	MCI Metro Access Transmission Services, LLC	Not Rated	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
7630	<b>Broadwing Communications, LLC</b>	В	Not Rated	75%	25%	14.66%	6.40%	12.59%
7522	Time Warner Telecom of California, L.P.	В	Baa2	75%	25%	14.66%	6.29%	12.57%
7761	Level 3 Communications, LLC	C++	Caa2	60%	40%	16.75%	7.26%	12.96%
2043	Pac-West Telecomm, Inc.	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.37%	13.00%
2463	<b>Qwest Communications Corporation</b>	C+	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.37%	13.00%
7686	Primus Telecommunications, Inc.	C	Not Rated	60%	40%	16.75%	7.48%	13.04%
	Other Interexchange Carriers	Not Rated	Not Rated	60%	40%	19.90%	8.13%	15.19%
	Other Interexchange Resellers	Not Rated	Not Rated	60%	40%	23.04%	8.90%	17.38%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Industry Notes

- Staff relied on the Capital Asset Pricing Model in the development of equity rates. Consideration was given to both the ex post and ex ante risk premiums.
- Staff did not consider the Discounted Cash Flow model because of the limited number of companies paying dividends.
- For companies whose common equity, preferred stocks and/or bonds are not rated, staff judgment is used in assigning the rates of return because the circumstances or reasons for not rating the bonds or preferred stocks are different for each company.
- Talk America was not included in the 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Sample for Interexchange companies because it was acquired by Cavalier Telephone Corporation on September 22, 2006. Yak Communications was also not included in the 2007 Interexchange Capitalization Rate Study because it was acquired by Globalive Communications Corporation on September 21, 2006.
- The capitalization rates derived are intended to be applied only to the companies' unitary interexchange telephone operations.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equity				Debt		
Value Line Rating	Recommended Rate	Flotation Cost in %	Adjusted Rate	Moody's Rating	Recommended Rate	Flotation Cost in %	Adjusted Rate
A+	13.50%	4.50%	14.14%	A-2	5.95%	1.70%	6.05%
B+, B	14.00%	4.50%	14.66%	A-3	6.03%	1.70%	6.13%
C+, C	16.00%	4.50%	16.75%	Baa1	6.10%	1.70%	6.21%
Other Interexchange Carriers	19.00%	4.50%	19.90%	Baa2	6.18%	1.70%	6.29%
Other Interexchange Resellers	22.00%	4.50%	23.04%	Baa3	6.29%	1.70%	6.40%
				Ba1	6.39%	1.70%	6.50%
				B2	6.82%	1.70%	6.94%
				В3	6.93%	1.70%	7.05%
				Caa1	7.03%	1.70%	7.15%
				Caa2	7.14%	1.70%	7.26%
				Caa3	7.25%	1.70%	7.37%
				Ca	7.35%	1.70%	7.48%
Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotat	ion Costs — 1-			Not Rated	8.00%	1.70%	8.13%
Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotat	$ion Costs = \frac{k_u}{1 - f}$	<u>-</u>		Not Rated	8.75%	1.70%	8.90%

Where: ku = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Summary of Rates of Return

Common Equit	y		Bonds	
Value Line Rating	Rate of Return <sup>1</sup>	Moody's Bond Yield	Moody's Bond Rating	Rate of Return
A+	13.50%	Aa = 5.75	Aa2	5.75%
B+, B	14.00%		Aa3	5.82%
C+, C	16.00%	A = 5.95	A1	5.88%
Other Interexchange Carriers	19.00%		A2	5.95%
Other Interexchange Resellers	22.00%		A3	6.03%
		Baa = $6.18$	Baa1	6.10%
			Baa2	6.18%
			Baa3	6.29%
			Ba1	6.39%
			Ba2	6.50%
			Ba3	6.61%
			B1	6.71%
			B2	6.82%
			В3	6.93%
			Caa1	7.03%
			Caa2	7.14%
			Caa3	7.25%
			Ca	7.35%
			Not Rated <sup>3</sup>	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Rates of Return on Common Equity were developed by staff based on the relative risk of the utilities in conjunction with the results of the Capital Asset Pricing Models.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Rates of Return on Bonds were based on Moody's Utility Bond Yields as of December 29, 2006. However, because Moody's assigns a yield only to the groups Aa, A and Baa for bonds, staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a refinement of the ratings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For companies whose bonds are not rated, staff judgement is used in assigning the rates of return because the circumstances or reasons for not rating the bonds or preferred stocks are different for each company.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Comparison of Rates of Return on Common Equity

·					
	Value Line A+, B+, B				
	2007	2006	Change		
E/P Ratio-Mean	4.76%	7.92%	-3.16%		
E/P Ratio-Median	5.04%	6.42%	-1.38%		
Div Yld + Div Growth-Mean	3.93%	12.76%	-8.83%		
Div Yld + Div Growth-Median	4.78%	8.43%	-3.65%		
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Mean	10.61%	12.55%	-1.93%		
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Median	10.92%	12.00%	-1.08%		
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Ante	15.57%	13.37%	2.20%		
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Post	13.42%	12.62%	0.80%		

			Value Lir	ne Ratings		
					Other IEX	Other IEX
		<u>A</u> +	B+, B	C+, C	Carriers	Resellers
	2006 Recommended Rate	13.50%	13.50%	15.50%	18.50%	21.50%
CAPM - Ex Ante		15.57%	15.57%	17.79%	NMF	NMF
CAPM - Ex Post		13.42%	13.42%	15.20%	NMF	NMF
	2007 Recommended Rate	13.50%	14.00%	16.00%	19.00%	22.00%

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Estimated			Dividend	Dividend	Estimated	Estimated	E/P	DvYld+	DvYld+
Value Line		Price	2007	2006	2006	Est. 2007	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGrth	ErngsGr
Rating	Company Name	12/29/06	EPS	EPS	Dividends	Amount	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
A+	AT&T Inc.	35.75	2.55	2.33	1.33	1.42	3.97%	2.50%	9.59%	7.13%	6.47%	13.57%
B+	Commonwealth Tel.	41.86	2.65	2.65	2.00	2.00	4.78%	0.00%	3.50%	6.33%	4.78%	8.28%
B+	CT Communications	22.92	0.86	0.85	0.42	NMF		11.50%	NMF	3.75%		11.50%
B+	Sprint Nextel	18.89	1.25	0.50	0.10	0.10	0.53%	0.00%	9.82%	6.62%	0.53%	10.34%
В	Broadwing Corp	15.62	0.19	0.59	0.00	NMF		0.00%	4.00%	1.22%		4.00%
В	Gen'l Communic. 'A'	15.73	0.55	0.39	0.00	NMF		0.00%	16.00%	3.50%		16.00%
В	Time Warner Telecom	19.93	0.06	0.53	0.00	NMF		0.00%	13.53%	0.30%		13.53%
C++	Level 3 Comm.	5.60	0.47	0.68	0.00	NMF		0.00%	16.83%	8.39%		16.83%
C+	Qwest Commun. Intl	8.37	1.80	0.30	0.00	0.00	0.00%	0.00%	6.04%	21.51%	0.00%	6.04%
C+	US LEC Corp.	9.31	0.19	0.92	0.00	NMF		0.00%	NMF	2.04%		NMF
	Mean						2.32%	1.40%	9.91%	6.08%	2.94%	11.12%
	Median						2.25%	0.00%	9.70%	5.04%	2.65%	11.50%
	Weighted Average										3.82%	12.01%

Sources: Columns a, b, d, e, f, g, h and i were extracted from the December 29, 2006 Value Line.

Column c was extracted from Yahoo Finance December 29, 2006 closing stock prices.

Column j is based on the average estimated earnings growth rate from Value Line, Zacks and Thomson Financial.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

	Value Line Rating			
Component	A+, B+, B	C+, C		
Expected Future Return	13.71%	13.71%		
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%	4.83%		
Risk Premium	8.88%	8.88%		
Relevered Beta <sup>3</sup>	1.21	1.46		
Adjusted Risk Premium	10.74%	12.96%		
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%	4.83%		
Projected Return on Common Equity	15.57%	17.79%		

Growth Component- Merrill Lynch Dividend Yield for S&P 500 - December 29, 2006 11.90% 1.81% 13.71%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Expected Future Return

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The estimated betas for A+, B+, B, C+, and C rated companies are based on interexchange data from the Beta Analysis page.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

	Value Line Rating			
Component	A+, B+, B	C+, C		
Total Return, Large Company Stocks (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%	12.30%		
Less: Long Term Government Bonds <sup>1</sup>	5.20%	5.20%		
Risk Premium	7.10%	7.10%		
Relevered Beta <sup>2</sup>	1.21	1.46		
Adjusted Risk Premium	8.59%	10.37%		
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	4.83%	4.83%		
Projected Return on Common Equity	13.42%	15.20%		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The estimated betas for A+, B+, B, C+, and C rated companies are based on interexchange data from the Beta Analysis page.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006 data.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i
				First		Debt		Wtg Avg
Value Line		Value Line	Zacks	Call	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equit
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>2</sup>	Ratio
A+	AT&T Inc.	1.20	1.56	0.88	1.21	0.20	1.09	0.13
B+	Commonwealth Tel.	NMF	0.70	0.59	0.65	0.34	0.54	0.00
B+	CT Communications	1.00	0.34	1.62	0.99	0.08	0.94	0.00
B+	Sprint Nextel	1.25	1.87	1.25	1.46	0.36	1.20	0.11
В	Broadwing Corp	1.45	3.93	NMF	2.69	0.15	2.47	0.00
В	Gen'l Communic. 'A'	1.25	0.84	0.87	0.99	0.57	0.74	0.00
В	Time Warner Telecom	2.00	4.12	1.83	2.65	0.50	2.04	0.01
	Mean	1.36	1.91	1.17	1.52	0.31	1.29	
	Median	1.25	1.56	1.07	1.21		1.09	
	Weighted				1.31		1.28	0.25
C++	Level 3 Comm.	1.35	0.72	1.71	1.26	1.00	0.79	0.04
C+	Fibernet Telecom	1.25	2.56	2.02	1.94	0.28	1.66	0.00
C+	Pac-West Telecom	1.00	1.09	NMV	1.05	25.33	0.06	0.00
C+	Qwest Commun. Intl	1.95	3.58	1.42	2.32	0.83	1.55	0.08
C+	US LEC Corp.	1.20	1.49	1.62	1.44	1.51	0.75	0.00
C	Primus Telecomm	0.90	2.43	1.14	1.49	12.97	0.17	0.03
	Mean	1.35	1.98	1.58	1.58	6.99	0.83	
	Median	1.25	1.96	1.62	1.46		0.77	
	Weighted				1.97		1.28	0.16

A+, B+ or B Rating: Relevered Beta based on 25% Debt Capital Structure and weighted average beta.  $1.53^{-3}$  C++, C+ or C Rating: Relevered Beta based on 40% Debt Capital Structure and weighted average beta.  $1.80^{-3}$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Standard and Poor's data was not available for many of the sample companies, therefore, First Call betas were used.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Unlevered Beta = Value Line Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1
					Mkt Value						
	Moody's		Common	Stock	Equity	Pfd	L.T.	Total	Common	Pfd	L.T.
Value Line	Bond		Stock	Price	(\$Millions)	Stock	Debt	Capital	Equity	Stock	Debt
Rating	Rating	Company Name	Outstanding	12/29/06	(d x e)	(\$Millions)	(\$Millions)	(\$Millions)	%	%	%
A+	A2	AT&T Inc.	3,842,900,000	35.75	137,383.7	0.0	26,799.0	164,182.7	83.68%	0.00%	16.32%
B+	Not Rated	Commonwealth Tel.	21,053,253	41.86	881.3	0.0	300.0	1,181.3	74.60%	0.00%	25.40%
B+	Not Rated	CT Communications	20,026,054	22.92	459.0	0.0	36.3	495.3	92.67%	0.00%	7.33%
B+	Baa3	Sprint Nextel	2,894,903,669	18.89	54,684.7	0.0	19,643.0	74,327.7	73.57%	0.00%	26.43%
В	Not Rated	Broadwing Corp	88,173,571	15.62	1,377.3	0.0	199.9	1,577.2	87.33%	0.00%	12.67%
В	B1	Gen'l Communic. 'A'	53,269,000	15.73	837.9	0.0	475.8	1,313.7	63.78%	0.00%	36.22%
В	Baa2	Time Warner Telecom	122,822,772	19.93	2,447.9	0.0	1,218.5	3,666.4	66.77%	0.00%	33.23%
		Mean							77.49%	0.00%	22.51%
		Median							74.60%	0.00%	25.40%
		Weighted Average							80.27%	0.00%	19.73%
C++	Caa2	Level 3 Comm.	1,174,953,605	5.60	6,579.7	0.0	6,577.0	13,156.7	50.01%	0.00%	49.99%
C+	Not Rated	Fibernet Telecom	7,008,849	6.66		0.0	13.3	60.0	77.83%	0.00%	22.17%
C+	Not Rated	Pac-West Telecom	37,667,528	0.05	1.9	0.0	47.7	49.6	3.80%	0.00%	96.20%
C+	Not Rated	Qwest Commun. Intl	1,903,591,000	8.37	15,933.1	0.0	13,228.0	29,161.1	54.64%	0.00%	45.36%
C+	Not Rated	US LEC Corp.	31,943,000	9.31	291.4	291.4	149.6	732.4	39.79%	39.79%	20.43%
C	Not Rated	Primus Telecomm	113,848,540	0.41	46.7	0.0	605.5	652.2	7.16%	0.00%	92.84%
		Mean							38.87%	6.63%	54.50%
		Median							44.90%	0.00%	47.68%
		Weighted Average							52.27% <sup>2</sup>	0.67%	47.07%

Sources: Columns a, c, d, g, h and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column b was extracted from Moody's Investor Service.

Column e was extracted from Yahoo Finance closing stock prices.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Due to the distress of the companies represented by this group, the common equity percentage is not indicative of market conditions thus, the capital structure derived is not adequate for developing capitalization rates.

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Interexchange Telephone Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	c	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
A+	AT&T Inc.	11.50%	7.60%	9.68%	9.59%
B+	Commonwealth Tel.	2.00%	NMF	5.00%	3.50%
B+	Sprint Nextel	NMF	9.40%	10.23%	9.82%
В	Broadwing Corp	4.00%	NMF	NMF	4.00%
В	Gen'l Communic. 'A'	16.00%	NMF	NMF	16.00%
В	Time Warner Telecom	13.30%	13.30%	14.00%	13.53%
C++	Level 3 Comm.	14.00%	14.00%	22.50%	16.83%
C+	Qwest Commun. Intl	NMF	4.60%	7.48%	6.04%
	Mean	10.13%	9.78%	11.48%	9.91%
	Median	12.40%	9.40%	9.96%	9.70%
	Weighted Average				9.65%

Sources: Columns a, b and c were extracted from Value Line.

Column d was extracted from the Zacks Investment Research, Inc. Column e was extracted from the Thomson Financial Network.

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies

			Capital	Structure	Rates of R	eturn	Basic
			Common		Common		Cap
SBE No.	Company Name	Rating	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
2512	Verizon Wireless (VAW) LLC	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2513	Sacramento Valley Limited Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2532	Los Angeles SMSA Ltd., Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2559	GTE Mobilnet of California, Ltd. Partnership	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2606	Cingular Wireless, LLC	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2720	Sprint PCS	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2737	Sprint Nextel Corporation	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2748	<b>OmniPoint Communications Inc.</b>	NR-1	75%	25%	13.61%	6.10%	11.74%
2552	Fresno MSA Limited Partnership	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2627	GTE Mobilnet of Santa Barbara L.P.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2671	California Rural Service Area #1, Inc.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2733	Metro PCS California/Florida, Inc.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
2745	West Coast P.C.S.	NR-2	75%	25%	14.40%	6.61%	12.45%
	Other Wireless Companies	NR-3	70%	30%	17.02%	7.12%	14.05%
	Wireless Reseller Companies	NR-4	65%	35%	19.63%	7.63%	15.43%

NR-1: Companies providing wireless service to the largest California service areas

NR-2: Companies providing wireless service to midsize California service areas

NR-3: Other wireless carriers (including Radio Telephone companies)

NR-4: All wireless reseller companies

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Industry Notes

- Staff relied on the Capital Asset Pricing Model in the development of equity rates. Consideration was given to both the ex post and ex ante risk premiums.
- Consideration was given to size premiums in assigning equity rates to the smaller wireless companies.
- The Discounted Cash Flow model was not relied upon because a majority of the companies in the study are not currently paying dividends.
- The following companies were not included in the 2007 Capitalization Rate Study sample for wireless companies:
  - 1. Century Tel, Inc. because it no longer provides wireless communications services.
  - 2. Alamosa Holdings and Ubiquitel Inc., previously affiliates exclusively reselling Sprint Nextel wireless services, were acquired by Sprint Nextel.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Eq	quity			Ве	ond	
	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation	Adjusted
Rating	Rate	Cost in %	Rate	Rating	Rate 1	Cost in %	Rate
NR-1	13.00%	4.50%	13.61%	Not Rated	6.00%	1.70%	6.10%
NR-2	13.75%	4.50%	14.40%	Not Rated	6.50%	1.70%	6.61%
NR-3	16.25%	4.50%	17.02%	Not Rated	7.00%	1.70%	7.12%
NR-4	18.75%	4.50%	19.63%	Not Rated	7.50%	1.70%	7.63%

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $\frac{k_u}{1-f}$ 

Where:  $k_u$  = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Staff reviewed bonds issued by major wireless companies with a presence in the largest markets which revealed a bond rating of A. Based on this, staff concludes that a reasonable debt rate is 6.00% (Moody's A and actual bond issuances), with an increase in the rates for the smaller market categories.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Summary of Rates of Return

Common Equity		Bonds					
Rating	Rate of Return <sup>1</sup>	Moody's Bond Yield	Moody's Bond Rating	Rate of Return <sup>2</sup>			
NR-1	13.00%	Aa = 5.75	Aa2	5.75%			
NR-2	13.75%		Aa3	5.82%			
NR-3	16.25%	A = 5.95	A1	5.88%			
NR-4	18.75%		A2	5.95%			
			A3	6.03%			
		Baa = $6.18$	Baa1	6.10%			
			Baa2	6.18%			
			Baa3	6.29%			
			Ba1	6.39%			
			Ba2	6.50%			
			Ba3	6.61%			
			B1	6.71%			
			B2	6.82%			
			В3	6.93%			
			Caa1	7.03%			
			Caa2	7.14%			
			Caa3	7.25%			
			Ca	7.35%			
ther Debt Rate Considered			Not Rated <sup>3</sup>				
tandard & Poor's Bond Yield Index (BBB) - Dec. 2006	Average 4	6.10%					

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Rates of Return on Common Equity were developed by staff based on the relative risk of the utilities in conjunction with the results of the Capital Asset Pricing Models.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Rates of Return on Bonds were based on Moody's Utility Bond Yields as of December 30, 2006. However, because Moody's assigns a yield only to the groups Aa, A and Baa for bonds, staff interpolates the difference between these groups in order to achieve a refinement of the ratings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For companies whose bonds are not rated, staff judgment is used in assigning the rates of return because the circumstances or reasons for not rating the bonds or preferred stocks are different for each company.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Rates from Standard & Poor's 2006 Bond Guide Yield Curves dated December 2006, estimated from the graphic representation.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Comparison of Return on Common Equity

	Value Line A+, B+, B				
	2007	2006	Change		
E/P Ratio-Mean	5.38%	4.92%	0.46%		
E/P Ratio-Median	5.38%	4.44%	0.93%		
Div Yld + Div Growth-Mean	N/A	6.75%	N/A		
Div Yld + Div Growth-Median	N/A	4.96%	N/A		
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Mean	8.86%	14.10%	-5.24%		
Div Yld + Earn.Growth-Median	8.86%	15.10%	-6.25%		
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Ante	14.60%	13.14%	1.46%		
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Post	12.64%	12.40%	0.24%		

<u> </u>	Ratings							
			Other Carriers	Resellers				
_	NR-1	NR-2	NR-3	NR-4				
2007 Valuation Division Recommended Rate <sup>1</sup>	13.00%	13.75%	16.25%	18.75%				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Staff relied upon the Ex Post and Ex Ante Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) in estimating the recommended equity rates for NR-1 categories. Equity rates for the other non-rated categories were extrapolated based on analyzing the relative risks of operating a wireless system within these categories.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies

# **Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante**

Component	Industry Computation
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Ex-Ante Risk Premium	8.88%
Beta <sup>3</sup>	1.10
Adjusted Risk Premium	9.77%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	14.60%

Dividend Yield for S&P 500 December 29, 2006

5 Year Projected Growth - Merrill Lynch

1.81% 11.90% 13.71%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal data as of December 29, 2006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Staff's estimate of Beta, see Beta Analysis for further detail

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

Component	Industry Computation
Common Stock Return (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup> Less: Income Return, L/T Government Bonds (1926-2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30% 5.20%
Ex-Post Risk Premium Beta <sup>2</sup>	7.10% 1.10
Adjusted Risk Premium Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>3</sup>	7.81% 4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	12.64%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates, Inc. Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Staff's estimate of Beta, see Beta Analysis for further detail

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal data as of December 29, 2006

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	I	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est.			2007	Dividend	Estimated	Estimated	E/P	Div Yld+	DvYld+
Value Line		Price	2007	2006	2006	Estimated	Yield	Dividend	Earnings	Ratio	DvGwth	ErnsGwth
Rating	Company Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Earnings	Dividends	Dividends	(g/c)	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
A++	Alltel Corp.	60.48	2.50	1.80	1.02	0.51	0.84%	NMF	6.53%	4.13%	N/A	7.37%
B+	Sprint Nextel	18.89	1.25	0.50	0.10	0.10	0.53%	NMF	9.82%	6.62%	N/A	10.34%
В	U.S. Cellular	69.59	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	20.05%	N/A	N/A	N/A
В	Telephone & Data Systems <sup>1</sup>	54.33	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	16.25%	N/A	N/A	N/A
C++	Dobson Comm.	8.71	0.25	0.03	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	45.50%	2.87%	N/A	N/A
C+	Centennial Comm.	7.19	0.16	0.20	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	31.68%	2.23%	N/A	N/A
C	Rogers Communications Inc.	59.60	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	30.00%	N/A	N/A	N/A
C	Rural Cellular	13.14	3.10	6.16	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF	23.59%	N/A	N/A
		-										
		Mean						N/A	22.83%	8.59%	N/A	8.86%
		Median						N/A	20.05%	2.55%	N/A	8.86%
		Weighted A	Average									9.59%

Sources: Columns a, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column c extracted from The Wall Street Journal closing prices as of December 29, 2006.

Column j is from the average column of the Long-Term Earnings Growth page.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Parent company of US Cellular

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Long-Term Earnings Growth

a	b	С	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
A++	Alltel Corp.	NMF	6.70%	6.35%	6.53%
B+	Sprint Nextel	NMF	9.40%	10.23%	9.82%
В	U.S. Cellular	NMF	20.00%	20.10%	20.05%
В	Telephone & Data Systems <sup>1</sup>	NMF	16.90%	15.60%	16.25%
C++	Dobson Comm.	NMF	48.20%	42.80%	45.50%
C+	Centennial Comm.	2.50%	46.30%	46.25%	31.68%
C	Rogers Communications Inc.	NMF	30.00%	30.00%	30.00%
C	Rural Cellular	NMF	NMF	NMF	NMF
	Mean	2.50%	25.36%	24.48%	22.83%
	Median	2.50%	20.00%	20.10%	20.05%
	Weighted Average				14.36%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Parent company of US Cellular

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Thomson		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Lin	e	Line	Zacks	Financial	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
A++	Alltel Corp.	NMF	1.11	0.69	0.90	0.12	0.84	0.03
B+	Sprint Nextel	1.25	1.87	1.25	1.46	0.36	1.20	0.23
В	U.S. Cellular	1.15	1.07	0.58	0.93	0.19	0.84	0.01
В	Telephone & Data Systems <sup>2</sup>	1.05	1.14	0.73	0.97	0.53	0.74	0.04
	Mean	1.15	1.30	0.81	1.07	0.30	0.90	
	Median	1.15	1.13	0.71	0.95		0.84	
	Weighted				1.26		1.06	
				2				
	Relevered Beta based on 25% De				1.08			
	Relevered Beta based on 25% De	ebt Capital struct	ure and a weighted	average beta <sup>3</sup>	1.27			

Note: The companies listed above represent less than 40% of the wireless market in the U.S. Other companies that represent the majority of the market are not included because their stock is not listed or they are subsidiaries of larger companies. Therefore, staff's estimate of Beta used for the CAPM is 1.10 for the companies in the NR-1 wireless markets in California.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Parent company of US Cellular

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Thomson		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Lin	ie	Line	Zacks	Financial	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
C++	Dobson Comm.	1.45	5.55	2.11	3.04	1.84	1.44	0.28
C+	Centennial Comm.	0.95	1.31	1.24	1.17	2.82	0.43	0.29
C	Rogers Communications Inc.	NMF	1.98	0.80	1.39	0.00	1.39	0.00
C	Rural Cellular	0.90	3.01	1.25	1.72	10.01	0.25	0.74
	Mean	1.10	2.96	1.35	1.83	3.67	0.88	
	Median	0.95	2.50	1.25	1.56		0.91	
	Weighted				1.64		1.22	
Relevered	d Beta based on 30% Debt Capital	structure and an	average beta. <sup>2</sup>	1	.10			
	d Beta based on 40% Debt Capital				.23			
	d Beta based on 30% Debt Capital		•		.53			
	d Beta based on 40% Debt Capital				.70			

Note: The companies listed above represent the smaller resellers and regional wireless market in the U.S. Therefore, to support the rates used for the CAPM for the companies in the NR-3 and NR-4 wireless markets in California, staff estimated a Beta of approximately 1.50 and 1.70, respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Value Line Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Size Premium

Decile of the New York Stock Exchange	Equity	Market Capitaliz (in thousands)	ation	Size Premium (Return in excess of CAPM)
1	over		14,096,886	-0.37
2	6,241,953	to	14,096,886	0.60
3	3,464,104	to	6,241,953	0.75
4	2,231,707	to	3,464,104	1.07
5	1,607,854	to	2,231,707	1.44
6	1,097,603	to	1,607,854	1.75
7	746,219	to	1,097,603	1.61
8	505,437	to	746,219	2.36
9	262,725	to	505,437	2.86
10	under		262,725	6.41

Source: SBBI:Valuation Edition 2005 Yearbook, Table 2

2007 Capitalization Rate Study Wireless Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k
			Common Equit				Total		Ratios	
			Stock	Total	Preferred	Long-Term	Capital	Common	Preferred	Long-Term
Value Line		Shares	Price	(\$Millions)	Stock	Debt	(\$Millions)	Equity	Stock	Debt
Rating	Company Name	(Millions)	12/29/06	(c*d)	(\$Millions)	(\$Millions)	(e+f+g)	(e/h)	(f/h)	(g/h)
A++	Alltel Corp.	373.63	60.48	22,597.14	0.26	2,711.60	25,309.00	89.28%	0.00%	10.71%
B+	Sprint Nextel	2,894.90	18.89	54,684.66	-	19,643.00	74,327.66	73.57%	0.00%	26.43%
В	U.S. Cellular	87.20	69.59	6,068.25	-	1,161.40	7,229.65	83.94%	0.00%	16.06%
В	Telephone & Data Sys. <sup>1</sup>	115.66	54.33	6,283.81	3.90	3,340.80	9,628.51	65.26%	0.04%	34.70%
						Totals	116,494.82			
							Mean	78.01%	0.01%	21.98%
							Median	78.75%	0.00%	21.25%
							Weighted Average	76.94%	0.00%	23.05%
		170.55	0.71	1 405 40	125.70	2.506.50	4.217.60	25.2204	2.220	C1 5 C0/
C++	Dobson Comm.	170.55	8.71	1,485.49	135.70	2,596.50	4,217.69	35.22%	3.22%	61.56%
C+	Centennial Comm.	105.34	7.19	757.39	-	2,137.90	2,895.29	26.16%	0.00%	73.84%
C	Rogers Communications Inc.	317.36	59.60	18,914.66	-	6.57	18,921.23	99.97%	0.00%	0.03%
C	Rural Cellular	14.27	13.14	187.51	504.70	1,371.90	2,064.11	9.08%	24.45%	66.46%
						Totals	28,098.32			
							Mean	42.61%	6.92%	50.48%
							Median	30.69%	1.61%	64.01%
							Weighted Average	75.97%	2.28%	21.76%

Sources:

Columns a, b, c, f and g were extracted from the December 29, 2006 Value Line.

No Value Line rating information available for Rogers Communications Inc. Rating for this company is estimated from published financials as of September 30, 2006. Column d obtained from The Wall Street Journal closing prices as of December 29, 2006.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Parent company of US Cellular.

#### California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies

		Rating	gs	Capital S	Structure	Rates	Rates of Return	
				Common				Cap
SBE No.	<b>Company Name</b>	Financial	Bond	Equity	Debt	Equity	Debt	Rate
402	CALNEV Pipe Line LLC	NR-1	NR-b	70%	30%	12.57%	6.45%	10.73%
461	SFPP, L.P.	NR-1	NR-b	70%	30%	12.57%	6.45%	10.73%
479	Chevron Pipeline Company	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
468	Shell California Pipeline Company L.P.	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
486	Pacific Pipeline System, LLC	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
480	ConocoPhillips Pipe Line Company	NR-2	NR-b	70%	30%	13.09%	6.45%	11.10%
	Other Pipeline Companies	NR-3	NR-c	70%	30%	14.14%	7.47%	12.14%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Industry Notes

- Staff relied primarily on the Discounted Cash Flow model in the development of equity rates.
- In assigning equity rates to smaller pipeline companies, the size premium information from Ibbotson and Associates was considered.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equit	y		Debt				
Value Line	Recommended	Flotation Cost	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Flotation Cost	Adjusted	
Rating	Rate	in %	Rate	Rating	Rate	in %	Rate	
NR-1	12.00%	4.50%	12.57%	NR-b	6.35%	1.70%	6.45%	
NR-2	12.50%	4.50%	13.09%	NR-c	7.35%	1.70%	7.47%	
NR-3	13.50%	4.50%	14.14%					

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $\frac{k_u}{1 - f}$ 

Where:  $k_u =$ The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

- NR-1: Not-Rated-1 pipelines are not directly traded because they are subsidiaries of larger companies. These are larger common carrier pipelines transmitting refined petroleum products.
- NR-2: Not-Rated-2 pipelines are not directly traded because they are subsidiaries of larger companies. These are larger common carrier pipelines transmitting crude oil.
- NR-3: Not-Rated-3 pipelines are smaller companies transporting petroleum products or crude oil.
- NR-b: Although these companies do not have rated debt securities, the rating class "Baa" was chosen to represent these subsidiaries of larger corporations.
- NR-c: Issues of this size are not normally rated. An additional increment of 100 basis points (before flotation costs) has been added to the "Baa" rate.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Comparison of Return on Common Equity

Description	2007	2006	Change
E/P Ratio - Mean	5.06%	5.21%	-0.15%
E/P Ratio - Median	5.02%	4.92%	0.10%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Mean	10.87%	12.11%	-1.24%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Median	10.95%	12.08%	-1.13%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Mean	11.44%	12.65%	-1.21%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Median	12.38%	13.28%	-0.90%
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Ante	8.83%	8.24%	0.59%
Capital Asset Pricing Model (CAPM) - Ex Post	8.03%	7.93%	0.10%

2007 recommended equity rates:

12.00% for Common Carrier product lines

12.50% for Common Carrier crude oil lines

13.50% for all other pipelines

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Equity Rates

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1
		Stock				2007	2007	2007	E/P	Div Yld+	Div Yld+
Value Line		Price	2006	2006	2007	Dividend	Hist. Div	Avg. Erns	Ratio	Div Gwth	Erns Gwth
Rating	Company Name	12/29/06	Earnings	Dividends	Est Div	Yield	Growth	Growth	(d/c)	(g+h)	(g+i)
D	Enhaides Engage	40.20	2.09	2.70	2.70	7.400/	1.500/	0.250/	6.020/	9.000/	7 1 40/
B++	Enbridge Energy	49.39	2.98	3.70	3.70	7.49%	1.50%	-0.35%	6.03%	8.99%	7.14%
B+	Buckeye Partners, L.P.	46.48	2.65	3.03	3.23	6.95%	5.50%	4.58%	5.70%	12.45%	11.53%
B+	Kinder Morgan Energy Partners, L.P.	47.90	2.00	3.25	3.40	7.10%	5.50%	6.77%	4.18%	12.60%	13.86%
В	TEPPCO Partners, L.P.	40.31	1.75	2.70	2.80	6.95%	2.50%	6.29%	4.34%	9.45%	13.23%
		Mean					3.75%	4.32%	5.06%	10.87%	11.44%
		Median					4.00%	5.44%	5.02%	10.95%	12.38%
		Weighted A	verage								12.17%

Sources: Columns a, d, e, f and h were extracted from Value Line.

Column c was extracted from the Yahoo Market Guide.

Column i is an average of Value Line, Zacks, and Thomson.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	С	d	e	f
Value Line					
Rating	Company Name	Value Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
B++	Enbridge Energy	-8.50%	3.70%	3.75%	-0.35%
B+	Buckeye Partners, L.P.	5.50%	4.00%	4.25%	4.58%
B+	Kinder Morgan Energy Partners, L.P.	6.00%	6.80%	7.50%	6.77%
В	TEPPCO Partners, L.P.	9.00%	5.00%	4.86%	6.29%
	Mean	3.00%	4.88%	5.09%	4.32%
	Median	5.75%	4.50%	4.56%	5.44%
	Weighted Average				5.03%

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

Component	Industry Computation
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%
Beta <sup>3</sup>	0.45
Adjusted Risk Premium	4.00%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	8.83%

Dividend Yield for S&P 500 December 29, 2006
5 Year projected growth per Merrill Lynch
Expected future return, S&P 500

1.81%
11.90%
13.71%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Weighted average using betas from Value Line, Zacks, and Standard & Poor for a representative sample of pipeline companies.

# 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

Component	Industry Computation
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) <sup>1</sup>	12.30%
Less: Long Term Government Bonds <sup>1</sup>	5.20%
Risk Premium	7.10%
Beta <sup>2</sup>	0.45
Adjusted Risk Premium	3.20%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds $^{\rm 3}$	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	8.03%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Weighted average using betas from Value Line, Zacks, and Standard & Poor for a representative sample of pipeline companies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Wall Street Journal December 29, 2006

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	С	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zacks	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
B+	Buckeye Partners, L.P.	0.75	0.27	0.24	0.42	0.53	0.32	0.07
B+	Kinder Morgan Energy Partners, L.P.	0.70	0.43	0.32	0.48	0.40	0.39	0.27
В	TEPPCO Partners, L.P.	0.70	0.23	0.15	0.36	0.48	0.28	0.10
	Mean	0.72	0.31	0.24	0.42	0.47	0.33	
	Median	0.70	0.27	0.24	0.42		0.32	
	Weighted Average				0.45		0.36	
	Relevered beta based on 30% Debt Capita	al Structure		(	).41 <sup>2</sup>			
	Relevered beta based on 30% Debt Capita	al Structure and	a weighted averag	ge beta (	).45 <sup>2</sup>			

Note: Enbridge Energy was not included because no meaningful beta information was available from Zacks and Standard and Poor's.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1
			Partnership		Market	Market					
	Moody		Units	Unit	Value	Value	Long Term	Total	Long Term		
Value Line	Bond		Outstanding	Price	Equity	Preferred	Debt	Capital	Debt	Preferred	Equity
Rating	Rating	Company Name	(000)	12/29/06	(000)	(000)	(000)	(000)	%	%	%
B++	NR	Enbridge Energy	77,162	49.39	3,811,011	0	1,961,400	5,772,411	33.98%	0.00%	66.02%
$\mathbf{B}+$	NR	Buckeye Partners, L.P.	39,676	46.48	1,844,122	0	981,100	2,825,222	34.73%	0.00%	65.27%
B+	NR	Kinder Morgan Energy Partners, L.P.	229,234	47.90	10,980,318	0	4,431,500	15,411,818	28.75%	0.00%	71.25%
В	NR	TEPPCO Partners, L.P.	75,714	40.31	3,052,011	0	1,472,100	4,524,111	32.54%	0.00%	67.46%
		Total			19,687,463	0	8,846,100	28,533,563			
		Mean							32.50%	0.00%	67.50%
		Median							33.26%	0.00%	66.74%
		Weighted Average							31.00%	0.00%	69.00%

Recommended Capital Structure for Common Carrier Pipelines for lien date January 1, 2007:

Debt - 30%

Equity - 70%

Sources: Columns a, d, g and h were extracted from Value Line.

Column b was extracted from the 2006 Moody's Public Utility and Industrial Manuals.

Column e was extracted from the Yahoo Market Guide.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Debt Yield Rate

Average of Industrial	and Public Utility Bond Yield:		
Aa	Industrial/Utility Average	5.72%	
A	Industrial/Utility Average	5.92%	
		5.72%	Aa
		5.92%	A
Baa	Industrial/Utility Average	6.35%	
	Recommended	6.35%	Baa/Ba

		Public	2007
 Bond Rating	Industrial	Utility	Average
Aaa	5.46%	N/A	5.46%
Aa	5.68%	5.75%	5.72%
A	5.89%	5.95%	5.92%
Baa	6.51%	6.18%	6.35%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Pipeline Companies Size Premium

Decile of the New York Stock Exchange	Equity	Market Capitaliz (in thousands)	ation	Size Premium (Return in excess of CAPM)
1	14,096,886	to	over	-0.37
2	6,241,953	to	14,096,886	0.60
3	3,464,104	to	6,241,953	0.75
4	2,231,707	to	3,464,104	1.07
5	1,607,851	to	2,231,707	1.44
6	1,097,603	to	1,607,851	1.75
7	746,219	to	1,097,603	1.61
8	505,437	to	746,219	2.36
9	262,725	to	505,437	2.86
10	under		262,725	6.41

Source: SBBI: Valuation Edition 2005 Yearbook, Table 2

## California State Board of Equalization State-Assessed Properties Division 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies

-		Ratin	Ratings		tructure	Rates o	f Return	
SBE No.	Company Name	Financial	Bond	Common Equity	Debt	Common Equity	Debt	Basic Cap Rate
843	Union Pacific Railroad Company	A	Baa2	75%	25%	13.87%	6.45%	12.02%
804	BNSF Railway Company	B++	Baa2	75%	25%	13.87%	6.45%	12.02%
802	Central Oregon & Pacific Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
810	California Northern Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
813	Pacific Harbor Lines	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
850	<b>Modesto &amp; Empire Traction Company</b>	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
865	San Diego & Imperial Valley Railroad Co. Inc.	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
882	Trona Railway Co.	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
897	San Joaquin Valley Railroad Company	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
899	Arizona & California Railroad	NR-1	NR-1	60%	40%	15.97%	7.98%	12.77%
	Other Railroad Companies	NR-2	NR-2	60%	40%	16.23%	9.00%	13.34%

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Industry Notes

- Staff relied upon the results of the following models in the development of equity rates:
  - 1. Discounted Cash Flow
  - 2. Capital Asset Pricing Model Consideration was given to both the ex post and ex ante risk premiums

For 2007, staff increased the common capital structure equity from 70% last year to 75% this year to reflect the increased equity in industry capital structures as reflected in the sample.

#### 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Flotation Cost Adjustment

	Equi	ity			Debt		
Value		Flotation				Flotation	
Line	Recommended	Cost	Adjusted	Moody's	Recommended	Cost	Adjusted
Rating	Rate	In %	Rate	Rating	Rate	In %	Rate
			·				
B++, B+	13.25%	4.50%	13.87%	Baa2	6.35%	1.70%	6.45%
NR-1	15.25%	4.50%	15.97%	NR-1 <sup>1</sup>	7.85%	1.70%	7.98%
			• • •				
NR-2	15.50%	4.50%	16.23%	$NR-2^2$	8.85%	1.70%	9.00%
INIX-Z	13.30%	4.50%	10.23%	1 <b>111-</b> 2	0.05%	1.70%	9.00%

Cost of Capital Adjusted for Flotation Costs =  $k_u$ 1 - f

Where:  $k_u$  = The cost of capital unadjusted for flotation costs

f = Flotation cost as a percentage of the value of securities issued

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> NR-1: Represent short line railroad companies with stable historical income. An additional 150 basis points (1.5%) were added to the Baa2 bond rate to represent the additional risk premium.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> NR-2: Represent short line railroad companies without stable historical income patterns. An additional 250 basis points (2.5%) were added to the Baa2 bond rate to represent the additional risk premium.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Comparison of Equity Rates

Description	2007	2006	Change
E/P Ratio - Mean	7.54%	6.60%	0.94%
E/P Ratio - Median	7.47%	6.63%	0.84%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Mean	12 920/	12 740/	1 000/
	13.83%	12.74%	1.09%
Dividend Yield + Dividend Growth - Median	14.67%	13.12%	1.55%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Mean	17.13%	16.44%	0.69%
Dividend Yield + Earnings Growth - Median	17.18%	16.94%	0.24%
Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex post	11.05%	11.34%	-0.29%
Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex ante	12.61%	11.97%	0.64%
State Assessed Properties Division Recommendation:	13.25%	13.25%	0.00%

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Equity Rates

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i	j	k	1	m
		Stock	Est Erns				Div Yield	ValueLine	Average	E/P	Div Yld +	Dv Yld +
Value Line	e Company	Price	Value Line	Earnings	Dividends	Est Div	2007	Dividend	Est Erns	Ratio	Dv Gwth	Erns Gwth
Rating	Name	12/29/06	2007	2006	2006	2007	(g/c)	Est Gwth	Gwth	(d/c)	(h+i)	(h+j)
Class 1 Ra	ilroads:											
A	Union Pacific Corp.	92.02	6.70	5.70	1.20	1.20	1.30%	4.50%	14.65%	7.28%	5.80%	15.96%
B++	Burlington Northern Santa Fe	73.81	5.65	5.00	0.90	1.00	1.35%	11.00%	15.18%	7.65%	12.35%	16.53%
B++	CSX Corp.	34.43	2.50	2.25	0.33	0.40	1.16%	19.00%	17.04%	7.26%	20.16%	18.20%
B+	Norfolk Southern Corp.	50.29	4.00	3.60	0.68	0.75	1.49%	15.50%	16.34%	7.95%	16.99%	17.83%
				Mean			1.33%	12.50%	15.80%	7.54%	13.83%	17.13%
				Median			1.33%	13.25%	15.76%	7.47%	14.67%	17.18%
				Weighted A	Average						12.99%	16.98%

Sources: Columns a, d, e, f, g and i were extracted from Value Line.

Column c was extracted from the Yahoo Market Guide.

Column j  $\,$  is an average of Value Line, Zacks, and Thomson.

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Long Term Earnings Growth

a	b	С	d	e	f
Value Line		Value			
Rating	Company Name	Line	Zacks	Thomson	Average
Class 1 Rai	ilroads:				
A	Union Pacific Corp.	13.00%	15.70%	15.26%	14.65%
B++	Burlington Northern Santa Fe	16.00%	14.20%	15.33%	15.18%
B++	CSX Corp.	17.50%	16.20%	17.42%	17.04%
B+	Norfolk Southern Corp.	18.00%	15.00%	16.03%	16.34%
	Mean	16.13%	15.28%	16.01%	15.80%
	Median	16.75%	15.35%	15.68%	15.76%
	Weighted Average				15.64%

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Ante

Component	Industry Computation
Expected Future Return, S&P 500 <sup>1</sup>	13.71%
Less: Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Risk Premium	8.88%
Beta	0.88
Adjusted Risk Premium	7.78%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	12.61%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Dividend Yield for S&P 500 December 29, 2006 5 Year projected growth per Merrill Lynch Expected future return, S&P 500

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Wall Street Journal as of December 29, 2006

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Capital Asset Pricing Model - Ex Post

Component	Industry Computation
Common Stock Return (1926 - 2006) 1	12.30%
Less: Long Term Government Bonds <sup>1</sup>	5.20%
Risk Premium	7.10%
Beta	0.88
Adjusted Risk Premium	6.22%
Risk Free Return 25 - 30 Year Treasury Bonds <sup>2</sup>	4.83%
Projected Return on Common Equity	11.05%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ibbotson Associates Study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Wall Street Journal as of December 29, 2006

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Beta Analysis

a	b	c	d	e	f	g	h	i
		Value		Standard		Debt		WTG Avg
Value Line		Line	Zack's	& Poor's	Average	Equity	Unlevered	Debt/Equity
Rating	Company Name	Beta	Beta	Beta	Beta	Ratio	Beta <sup>1</sup>	Ratio
Class 1 Ra	ilroads:							
A	Union Pacific Corp.	0.90	0.68	0.70	0.76	0.27	0.65	0.08
B++	Burlington Northern Santa Fe	0.95	0.82	0.85	0.87	0.25	0.76	0.07
B++	CSX Corp.	0.95	0.98	1.00	0.98	0.33	0.82	0.06
B+	Norfolk Southern Corp.	1.00	0.74	0.82	0.85	0.31	0.72	0.07
	Mean	0.95	0.81	0.84	0.87	0.29	0.74	
	Median	0.95	0.78	0.84	0.86		0.74	
	Weighted Average				0.85		0.73	0.28
	Relevered Beta based on 25% Do	ebt Capital Str	ucture			0.89 <sup>2</sup>		
	Relevered Beta based on 25% Do	ebt Capital Str	ucture and a wei	ghted average Beta	ı	0.88 2		
Non-Close	1 Railroads:							
B+	Genesee and Wyoming	1.20	1.19	1.18	1.19	0.21	1.06	0.12
В	Rail America, Inc.	1.20	1.52	N/A	1.36	0.63	0.99	0.27
	Mean	1.20	1.36	1.18	1.28	0.42	1.02	
	Median	1.20	1.36	1.18	1.28		1.02	
	Weighted Average				1.26		1.03	0.39
	Relevered Beta based on 40% Do	eht Canital Str	ucture			1.43 <sup>2</sup>		
		-		ahtad ayamaga Data		1.43 <sup>2</sup>		
	Relevered Beta based on 40% De	edi Capitai Str	ucture and a wei	gmed average Beta	ı	1.44		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unlevered Beta = Beta/[1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Relevered Beta = [Unlevered Beta][1+(1-t)(D/E)]; where D/E is the debt to equity ratio, t is the tax rate (assumed to be 40%)

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Capital Structure

a	b	c	d	e	f	h	i	j	1
			Common	Common	Market				
	Moody		Stock	Stock	Value	Long Term	Total	Long Term	Common
Value Line	Bond		Outstanding	Price	Equity	Debt	Capital	Debt	Equity
Rating	Rating	Company Name	(000)	12/29/06	(000)	(000)	(000)	%	%
Class 1 Railro	ads:								
A	NR	Union Pacific Corp.	269,720	92.02	24,819,634	6,657,000	31,476,634	21.15%	78.85%
3++	NR	Burlington Northern Santa Fe	359,207	73.81	26,513,069	6,611,000	33,124,069	19.96%	80.04%
3++	NR	CSX Corp.	435,182	34.43	14,983,316	4,937,000	19,920,316	24.78%	75.22%
B+	NR	Norfolk Southern Corp.	396,892	50.29	19,959,699	6,141,000	26,100,699	23.53%	76.47%
		Total					110,621,718	=	
						Mean		22.35%	77.65%
						Median		22.34%	77.66%
						Weighted Ave	rage	22.01%	77.99%
Non-Class 1 R	ailroads:								
B+	NR	Genesee and Wyoming	41,815	26.24	1,097,226	232,200	1,329,426	17.47%	82.53%
В	NR	Rail America	39,283	16.08	631,671	396,700	1,028,371	38.58%	61.42%
		Total					2,357,796	=	
						Mean		28.02%	71.98%
						Median		28.02%	71.98%
						Weighted Ave	rage	26.67%	73.33%
Recomme	nded Capital S	Structures for lien date January 1, 2007	Equity	Debt					
		Class 1 Railroads:	75%	25%	_				

40%

60%

Non-Class 1 Railroads:

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies

## **Interpolation of Railroad Bond and Preferred Stock Yields**

a	b	c	d
		Number of	Incremental Increase
Moody Average Rating	Moody Average Bond Yield	Increments	(b/c)
Aa = Aa2	5.72%		
A = A2	5.92%		
Difference	0.21%	3	0.07%
A = A2	5.92%		
Baa = Baa2	6.35%		
Difference	0.43%	3	0.14%

	Interpolated Railroad Bond Yield					
a	b	c	d			
Moody Average Rating	Moody Average Bond Yield	Incremental Increase	Interpolated Bond Yield			
Aa2	5.715%		5.72%			
Aa3		0.07%	5.78%			
A1		0.07%	5.85%			
A2	5.920%		5.92%			
A3		0.14%	6.06%			
Baa1		0.14%	6.20%			
Baa2	6.345%		6.35%			
Baa3		0.14%	6.49%			

## 2007 Capitalization Rate Study Railroad Companies Debt Yield Rates

Bond Rating	Industrial	Public Utility	2006 Average
Aaa	5.46%	NA	5.46%
Aa	5.68%	5.75%	5.72%
A	5.89%	5.95%	5.92%
Baa	6.51%	6.18%	6.35%

Source: Moody's Daily Long-Term Corporate Bond Yield Averages as of December 29, 2006